COMH 36.1

NATIONAL SEMINAR ON ALTERNATIVE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT E.C.C., WHITEFIELD, BANGALORE Afternoon session, Thursday 13th Oct.,1994 Some Notes on the theme

.ws

TECHNOLOGY AND ECOLOGY

The need for seminars or workshops or research on 'sustainable alternatives' arises because of the Hobson's choice we face between technology and ecology: promoting one always seems to be at the expense of the other. Technology being seen as the primary mode of promoting human well-being, and ecology the basis of the well-being of our planet, the choice between the two leads to a serious dilemma. Is there any way out of this dilemma? Our present condition on planet earth is such that we had better find a way out, and that too pretty quickly. In my opinion, the only really viable way out lies in recognizing the link between ecology, morality and spirituality - all three arise from our quest for `wholeness'- and this same `wholeness' is also the fountainhead of all creativity, a flowering of which can show us the way to meeting our needs(including technologies) without destroying the ecological balance.

To understand this link better, let us begin by looking at an ancient Chinese story:

When Tzu-kung was passing through Han-yin, he saw an old man who was engaged in irrigating his vegetable plots. The way this old man did it was to let himself down into the well-pit by footholes cut into the side and emerge clasping a pitcher which he carefully emptied into a channel, thus expending a great deal of energy with very small results.

"There exists", Tzu-kung said to him, "a contrivance with which one can irrigate a hundred vegetable plots a day. Unlike what you are doing, it demands a very small expenditure of energy, but produces very great results. Would you not like me to tell you about it?" The gardener raised his head and gazed at Tzu-kung. "What is it like?", he asked. "It is an instrument carved out of wood", said Tzu-kung, "heavy behind and light in front. It scoops up the water like a bale, as quickly as one drains a bath-tub. Its name is the well-sweep".

A look of indignation came into the gardener's face. He laughed scornfully, saying,"I used to be told by my teacher that where there are cunning contrivances there will be cunning performances, and where there are cunning performances there will be cunning hearts. He in whose breast a cunning heart lies has blurred the pristine purity of his nature; he who has blurred the pristine purity of his nature has troubled the quiet of his soul, and with one who has troubled the quiet of his soul the Tao will not dwell. It is not that I do not know about this invention, but that I should be ashamed to use it."

In the context of our discussion linking ecology with morality and spirituality, what this old Chinese gardener had to say about the introduction of even a simple technology like the well-sweep leading to a disturbance of our `pristine purity' without which `the Tao will not dwell' in our hearts makes very interesting reading. Even more important, the link this gardener has made between `cunning contrivances', `cunning performances' and `cunning hearts' is worth deep reflection. This is particularly relevant in today's world, where 'smart' machines are the order of the day, and the smarter we and our machines are, the more civilized we are supposed to be. Mahatma Gandhi had questioned this approach in a very fundamental way in his 'Hind Swaraj', maintaining that a process that makes jus more cunning and therefore more self-centered and selfish cannot claim to be having a 'civilizing' effect on us. When, on a visit to England, he was asked by a reporter, "Sir, what do you think of Western civilization?", he replied puckishly," I think it would be a good idea"!

Gandhiji's viewpoint in this regard have been shared by many wise personalities that we hold in high esteem, such as Albert Einstein, Will Durant, Arnold Toynbee and Erwin Schroedinger. To quote Arnold Toynbee:

"The most obvious ingredient in the Western civilization is technology, yet man cannot live by technology alone. In the fulness of time when the ecumenical house of many mansions stands firmly on its own foundations and the temporary Western scaffolding falls away, as I have no doubt it will, I believe it will become manifest that the foundations are firm at plast because they have been carried down to the bedrock of religion."

Like Gandhi, Toynbee too recommended a new era where the foundations of all human pursuits, including in the field of technology, are based upon 'the bedrock of religion'. Like Gandhi, again, he was not referring to any particular religion or any rites, rituals or dogmas, but to those wonderful processes of enhancing our level of consciousness that Einstein had termed 'the cosmic religious experience', and which Gandhi had called 'the religion that underlies all religions'.

What possibly could be the connection between technology, that produces goods and services for our 'here and now' existence, and religion, which is generally associated with afterlife? This question often arises because of our ignorance of religion's deep connection with **this** life. Once the connection between religion in its true form and **this** life is understood in its proper perspective, we can find an answer to one of the most difficult dilemmas that modern man is facing: the apparent contradiction between technology and ecology. The enormity of this problem was referred to by the then Soviet Foreign Minister, Eduardo Shevardnadze, during the process of 'thawing' the cold war in which he played an important role. Pointing out that the unforeseen but absolutely disastorous consequences of their rapid strides in technology was one of the main reasons for the failure of the Soviet experiment, he said:

"We are positive that the impending environmental disaster is a threat even greater than nuclear weapons. The process of disarmament has started and talks are underway. As for environmental hazards, mankind has not yet fully realized the full extent of the danger they carry and does not yet know any answer." When we study some of the burning ecological issues of the day, such as the ozone layer depletion or the vanishing non-renewable resources, we get some picture of the horrors we may be subjected to in the years to come. Yet, as Shevardnadze was wise enough to point out, we have no clue as to how these disasters can be avoided. It seems a Hobson's choice between technologies that improve our standard of living and environmental preservation without which life on earth itself is likely to be wiped out.

This is a global problem of the most immense magnitude. How can we find a clue to the answers required? To do so, as we are sitting here on the Navadarshanam land, let us shift our focus from the global to the local.

When Navadarshanam's friends and well-wishers obtained this land from the local villagers, it could have been easily classified as 'wasteland', a term used for it by an IAS officer who had come for one of Atheetha Ashram's health camps. The top soil had been washed away, the land had become highly unproductive and there were only three trees in the entire 105 acres. It is now less than two years since we have been able to take full possession of this land, and erect a fairly good (though not foolproof) fence. We have tried to ensure that nature regenerates itself here, and that this process is not disturbed by grazing, logging or forest fires. We have not succeeded completely in our efforts - it is not easy to control the actions of hundreds of surrounding villagers who own many thousands of cattle, especially as we have bent over backwards to ensure good relations with them. Yet, as you can see, the results are remarkable. Several thousand trees have made their appearnace, without our having planted them in any way. Prominent among them are honge, accacia, flame of tHe forest, bilwar and the wild variety of jamun. These trees, the everpresent grass, the many varieties of birds (our friend Omkar Krishnan has identified 111 varities that can now be spotted here) and the unhindered activity of the insects and microorganisms have all contributed to a fantastic regeneration of the soil here. Perhaps 10 years from now, the land will be like it is at the one place we know where a similar experiment has been carried out - the Valley School on Kanakapura Road south of Bangalore, which is now a lush, green forest where anything planted grows so well.

How did this land start regenerating itself despite having reached such a degraded condition? We can talk about the effect of the birds, insects, micro-organisms etc., but the fact of the matter is that we do not know and we cannot know, that is, at the level of the intellect, how this regeneration started and is carrying on. The mysterious processes of nature, and of life itself, are beyond the ken of our analytical, dissecting mind. This is the fundamental point we need to internalize if we want to understand what ecology is all about, and to resolve the technology-ecology dilemma. Donald Worster drove home this point with reference to soil regeneration:

"We can no more manufacture a soil with a tank of chemicals than we can invent a rain forest or produce a single bird. We may enhance the soil by helping its processes along, but we can never recreate what we destroy. The soil is a resource for which there is no substitute. Like the earth itself, it is a network of activity that we cannot yet understand let alone replicate."

The soil, and the earth itself, has life, and the Science of Life is not the physics and chemistry of the molecules that constitue our bodies, which only act as containers of this life force for limited periods of time. Once this fundamental fact is grasped, the link between ecology, morality and spirituality falls into place, and we can then recognize the immense necessity for those wonderful processes of education that Einstein referred to as 'the cosmic religious experience' - processes that can lead to a flowering of our creative talents in such a way that we will create technologies that help rather than destroy ecology by swimming along with rather than battling the tides of nature. Towards the end of his life, the great psychologiest Carl Rogers termed this possibility 'the most exciting challenge' before us in a speech appropriately titled "Do we dare?":

"Perhaps in the coming generation of younger psychologists, hopefully unencumbered by university prohibitions and resistances, there may be a few who will dare to investigate the possibility that there is a lawful reality which is not open to our five senses; a reality in which present, past and future are intermingled, in which space is not a barrier and time has disappeard; a reality which can be perceived and known only when we are passively receptive, rather than actively bent on knowing. It is one of the most exciting challenges posed to psychology."

It is such an education that will open our eyes to the true secrets of the universe of which we are an integral part. In other words, learning to close the eyes of our consciousness to the external, physical world of duality will open our eyes to the wonderful, subtle forces that are at the root of our life and all creation, including this physical world. This is of course the path that the Father of our Nation had been constantly recommending to us. He was not 'anti-technology' or 'antiscience', as is often made out; but spoke of a different kind of science, that would lead to even greater scientific 'miracles' than we are witnessing:

"Modern science is replete with illustrations of the seemingly impossible having become posible within living memory. But the victories of physical science would be nothing against the victory of the Science of Life, which is summed up in Love which is the Law of our Being."

It is such a new Science of Life that would on the one hand recognize the reality of the spiritual dimensions that are transcendent yet immanent (i.e., all around us, rather than in some distant heaven), and on the other hand lead to the creation of technologies that enhance rather than destroy ecology.

T.S.Ananthu



THE NEWSLETTER OF DISABILITY DIVISION ACTIONAID-INDIA

EDITOR'S COMMENT

Sustainability of voluntary effort in any field is a concept with many dimensions, with various factors contributing or detracting from it. There is a growing acceptance of the need for prog. nes to be sustainable and not wind up or became non- productive. With increasing human care needs, limited resources and increasing cost of services, it is recognised that judicious and optimal use of available resources is important. The earlier assumption that doing "good work" is sufficient to ensure a perpetual flow of funds is slowly being replaced with the recognition that results are important and that programmes need to be effective and accountable. In the Guest Editorial, Dr. Ravi Narayan brings together a balloonist overview of factors from real life experience to support individuals, organisations and projects who may be facing a sustainability problem, to help them evaluate

themselves and identify the contributing factors. The article would have achieved its primary purpose if it helps in providing an evolving framework for problem identification.

This issue carries a review of recent research on childhood disability in the Caribbean, along with the details of the development of a Disability, Attitude, Belief Behav iour (DABB) research project being carried out jointly by the Department of Psychology, University of Allahabad and the International Centre for Advancement of Community Based Rehabilitation(ICACBR) of Queens University, Kingston, Canada. The use of Focus Group Discussion in an urban slum disability programme, and the importance of early identification and assessment in developmental disabilities are described in other articles. Issues of employment opportunities and work training for people with disabilities have also been dealt with in this issue. The analysis of the feedback on the newsletter is presented as well. The feedback analysis suggests that the target population and the contents of the newsletter are appropriate and that it contains information which is useful and not available elsewhere.

The summary proceedings of the Symposium on Research and Evaluation held on 3 May 1993 in Bangalore, along with the papers presented and circulated on the occasion, constitute the Supplement of this issue.

> DR. MAYA THOMAS DIRECTOR DISABILITY DIVISION ACTIONAID - INDIA

GUEST EDITORIAL SUSTAINABILITY OF PROGRAMMES IN THE VOLUNTARY SECTOR - Reflections on Some Questions

INT' DUCTION

This paper attempts to identify parameters and determinants of sustainability of programmes primarily focused on disability care. It looks at why some programmes grow, develop in a meaningful way and remain creative for longer phases of their evolution; and why some programmes wind up, become inactive or remain stagnant and sometimes even unproductive.

The identification of facilitating as well as risk factors from a collective experience could serve many purposes. The most important purpose of this exercise could be to outline a list of self evaluation questions or issues that would help every organisation to review itself and to strengthen its own development by identifying lacunae in efforts that need to be attended. From the funding partners' point of view, it may help to decide which projects should be selected and which should be supported with caution. This may however degenerate into a 'betting on the winning horse' situation, which is undesirable. More important than both these likely purposes is however, an opportunity to learn from each others' experience.

This paper attempts to bring experiences and perspectives from the larger/wider sector of

voluntary effort and to build a framework for exploration by providing some principles and perhaps provocative questions. While much of this comes from beyond the 'disability sector' of voluntary effort, these issues of 'sustainability' are relevant to all types of voluntary projects irrespective of focus or objective.

RECOGNISING OUR DIVERSITY

A short historical overview of voluntary effort in India highlighting key thrusts, focus and impulses is a necessary adjunct to help one to appreciate the diversity and wealth of experi-

CONTENTS Vol.4 No.2 1993

Editor's Comment	An Approach Towards Early Identification and Assessment of Developmental Needs in Children	
The DABB Research Project	A Perspective in Reverse	
Focus Group Discussion with Parents of Disabled Children	Information on Publications	

ence. Do we realise what a 'mosaic' we represent?

In the last five decades since Independence, voluntary effort in the country has passed through many phases of growth in terms of focus, key thrusts and in its relation and context to government effort. While each decade has had its main theme, as it were, affecting the specific voluntary agency that may have developed in that decade, these are not watertight phases that can help to classify projects into one type or another. The concept of diversity in focus or thrusts only helps to understand the reality - that any collective effort of a group of voluntary agencies at any point of time, will discover this diversity and mosaic of expectations and experience, and that this can often be tracked back to the original vision or impulse of the voluntary agency at the time of its inception.

Pre-1950s: Most of the voluntary sector was deeply involved and linked with the National Movement for Independence.

1950s: The focus was on collaboration with the Government of India in the common task and commitment to Community Development, and collaboration was significant.

1960s: With the experience of Government programmes, the operationalisation of development strategies, and a growing understanding of field realities, the inadequacies of the strategies themselves began to emerge. This led to intense dissatisfaction. Alternative socio-political solutions began to emerge in the development sector leading from collaboration to confrontation.

1970s: The realisation that alternative sociopolitical systems needed alternative technology systems, alternative care delivery systems and alternative human power trainers led to the decade of 'Alternative' generation, focusing on health, education, environment, women's issues and trade unionism.

1980s: As the number of voluntary agencies in development increased, two additional features emerged. First there was a growing recognition of the need for collective support and efforts leading to networking. Secondly the alternative generation began to recognise the need of projects that moved from alternative service provision to supporting activities like training, lobbying, issue raising, communicating, research and policy generation. The era of specialisation had arrived.

1990s: The overall themes of this emerging decade have been collaboration with the government and 'professionalisation'. The voluntary sector seems to have come of age and is now actively contacted for collaborative efforts by the Government. While this should take the form of a critical collaboration, there is a growing danger that it will be more of a co-option. The need for professionalisation is also sweeping voluntary effort and while this is definitely important in the context of improving efficiency of efforts and increasing impact, the danger lies in professionalisation bringing in market economy values. Both these factors have also led indirectly to a phenomenal proliferation and mushrooming of voluntary effort - high in quantity and low in quality, which seems to be a matter of serious concern.

Where would we place ourselves in this evolving and interpretative history? What are the key thrusts and focus of each of our projects? What are our similarities and what are our differences?

Do we recognise that our diversities are in the area of our focus, our size, our ideologies, our structures, our leadership, our governance, our approaches, our levels of functioning, our methodologies, our linkages, our management and indeed our evolution?

Could we pause and reflect on this diversity, and affirm and recognise the mosaic of experiences and impulses that we represent?

SUSTAINABLE

Reflecting on the dictionary definition of a word helps us to discover the 'true depth' of its meaning. Colloquial usage often focuses on a narrow meaning, and in the context of sustainability, it primarily has acquired an economic dimension. There are ten definitions which help us to explore the larger concept of the word "Sustainable". These are:

To uphold	To perpetuate	
To bear with	To maintain	
To suffer	To support	
To give strength to	To keep alive	
To preserve	To keep going	

There may be many more.

We should therefore include all this and not just how to 'find the funds for' continuing our programme. Also, our focus should not be just on a time bound project but essentially a creative process, which we seek to initiate through our work.

LEARNING FROM EACH OTHERS' EXPERIENCE

While reflecting on our diversities, we might begin to doubt whether our experiences can really be relevant to each other. I believe they can be relevant, if inspite of our diversities we adopt some principles in our sharing and learning.

First, we must recognise that the evolution, growth, effectiveness, methodology and impact of our projects are affected by these diversities. Hence we should not extrapolate from our situation into that of others. We cannot just generalise for all situations from our own micro situation, and generalisations if made, should really be suggestions with caution.

We should learn from each others' experi-

ACTIONAID DISABILITY NEWS

ences, focusing on overall approaches rather than making it a quest for models or the identification of 'package deals' or services.

Ultimately each of us must evolve our own creative response recognising our own local realities and our own particular constraints.

An intracellular or single experience or single project exploration must be replaced by appreciating multiple experience and multiple projects, which could be termed as a 'balloonist' overview. This paper is an attempt at building such an overview.

Finally while we learn from reviewing our successes, we need to seriously reflect on our failures as well. Learning from our failures can often be more significant than the appreciation of our success, though this is seldom done.

RECOGNISING THE PHASES OF OU⁻ GROWTH

Sustainability must also always be seen in the context of the phase in which our action is located. All voluntary effort starts with the catalyst phase - about 1 -2 years of initial high intensity involvement of a few initiators, followed by a growth phase - involving a creative expansion of work and outreach - often sustained for at least 2-3 years.

In most cases the 5th year can be termed the crisis phase - with intensive individual styles of the inception phase clashing with the growing collective demands of the growth phase. A sort of evolving mismatch, often focused on styles of functioning and processes of decision making, takes place. This is further complicated by factors of routinization, bureaucratization and inadequate decentralisation.

The crisis phase then leads to a status quo phase if not tackled adequately. Alternatively. a re-evolution phase may emerge depending very much on how creatively the organisation understands the crisis and tackles it. Project or process sustainability must appreciate these phases of the growth process and be sensitive to it. While the overall focus of the project could be similar in all the phases, the time allotted for dimensions of work, like planning, training, action, team building and evaluation would be different in each of these phases.

FRAMEWORK FOR FACTOR IDENTIFICATION

As a prelude to this reflection, all the factors that in different experiences had led to serious review or enquiry, of the sustainability of a project or process were listed. These were then classified into groups, with a logic built up for their classification. The result shows that factors affecting sustainability can be classified into seven groups:

Internal factors

External factors (agency-target interactions) Funding agency factors

ACTIONAID DISABILITY NEWS

Agency-Government interaction factors

Monitoring/evaluation related factors Support mechanisms

National/regional climate factors

EXPLORING SOME FACTORS FOR SUSTAINABILITY

Each of the ideas identified in this section is based on a real life problem, but what has been highlighted is the issue and not the actual problem situation, to maintain confidentiality.

This set of questions could help each project reflect on its own state of growth and identify whether that aspect of its work could become an important contributor to the nonsustainability of the work in the near future or in the long term.

This is not an exhaustive list. An exploration of the readers' experience may identify even more ors and issues. The list will however very likely reaffirm some of the existing and ongoing problems.

INTERNAL FACTORS

These are factors that operate within the management structure of the project/agency and focus on aspects of governance.

Do we have a clarity in our goals, objectives, roles and types of services we would like to organise through our project/institution?

Lack of clarity generates ad-hoc responses and confuses the project team and its partners, reducing motivation and job satisfaction as well.

Do we have hidden agenda in our work? Political? Religious? Economic? Or even the pursuit of power, status and individual glory? All these make our work less sustainable in the long run, diverting effort from stated objectives to other pre-occupations.

Does management style - planning, decision making, supervision and evaluationinvolve the whole team in an increasingly participatory way or do we continue to believe in orthodox top-down, hierarchical and authoritarian models of management? When team members at all levels experience a sense of participation in the project evolution, long term sustainability is greatly enhanced.

Do we have a rational process of staff selection and provide team members with adequate financial and other forms of work security? Or are we ad-hoc in this aspect of management as well - eg., selecting staff in an ad-hoc manner, paying some more or some less and generally deciding issues on extraneous influences? Work under voluntary auspices - whether part time or full time; truly voluntary or getting some remuneration needs a higher degree of commitment and motivation because of the nature of the work and the insecurity of the situation. Rational and meaningful staff security including social security can go a long way to increase

sustainability.

While we cannot always get the type of volunteer and team member we need, do we have an ongoing process of staff development and enrichment that not only orients the staff to the goals of the organisation, but consistently upgrades their knowledge and skills? Creative staff development provides space for every team member to discover his own strengths and potentials, and prevents the 'cog in the wheel' feeling that can be detrimental to sustainability.

EXTERNAL FACTORS

These are factors that operate at the interface between the project/agency and its targets, beneficiaries or partners.

Are staff adequately oriented about whom they are trying to reach through the project initiatives? In institutional care this was relatively easy because we had a 'captive' target. In community oriented programmes this clarity is crucial. Are we focusing on all the community or those who are more marginalised or underserved? Are we reaching those who can be reached easily or are we focusing on reaching the unreached?

Does our team work from a superior cross cultural position looking down upon the community and its culture as different and inferior from their own? Or do they make attempts to reduce the gaps between 'us' and 'them', between literate and illiterate by identifying with the local culture and building bridges of understanding and shared values?

A cultural gap between the 'provider' and the 'community served' can be a far greater barrier than even a physical structure like a wall between the project and the community.

Does our team understand our efforts as a skills transfer, demystification process so that the community and all our field partners grow in knowledge and skills or do the skills and information remain confined to us at the end of the process? My surmise is that sustainability of a project is directly proportional to the levels of demystification and 'skills transfer' in a project since this is one of the key investments in community level sustainability.

Does our concept of participation mean the 'myopic' version that is rather common, of the community participating in the services we provide or does it involve the 'wide angle' view that 'we need to involve the community and its representatives' in all aspects of the planning, decision making, organisation and evaluation aspects of the programme'? In the ultimate analysis this is probably the most crucial component of long term sustainability. Have we been able to generate a need, a consumer awareness, and more importantly a consumer commitment to the continuation of the programmes?

Do our team members give primary importance to learning from their own field experience or do we base our actions on concepts and solutions imported from elsewhere? A corollary of this is the importance we give to feedback from the community and our field practice - especially from the grassroot level field worker and the community based volunteers. The more we focus on grassroot realities, the more we will respond with creative solutions to local problems, and the more sustainable will be the process we seek to promote.

FUNDING AGENCY FACTORS

Most funding partners are concerned about the issue of sustainability of projects they support and rightly so. However most of them do not realise that they themselves can be a major factor in the sustainability process, sometimes supporting it positively, and sometimes causing a problem.

Do our funding partners have a project or process orientation?

Understanding the work initiated by a partner as a process in the community, and not just as a time bound project with fixed time schedules and targets is very helpful, since it allows the project to evolve gradually, responding to local needs and constraints. However close may be the partner's interaction or experience with a community, a project proposal can never predict all the possibilities and is, at best a guestimate or probability. So when targets are not achieved within a time schedule, both partner and funder must evaluate the problem together, asking why? and not, why not? This helps long term sustainability.

Do our funding partners have a quantity or quality orientation in evaluation?

Linked to the above factor is also the problem of evaluation by funding agencies which most often focuses on quantity indicators and not on quality indicators. Quantity indicators such as how much immunisation was given and how many pills were distributed are given far more importance than quality indicators such as how many decisions were made by the locals and how many mothers have skills or knowledge now, which they did not have before etc. When 'providing' becomes more important than 'enabling', community participation, which is crucial for long-term sustainability, is not activated adequately.

Is the relationship between our funding partners and us - an imposing or supporting relationship?

The funding agency - partner linkage is a major issue. When it is a true partnership with both funder and partner seeing the available funds as being held in trusteeship on behalf of the people, then sustainability is enhanced because the partnership is based on a relationship between two adults.

When the funder-partner linkage is a donorbeneficiary relationship, then the linkage becomes one between unequals, and a parentchild or master-servant situation develops which is unhealthy. Funding agencies make subtle demands or lay down conditions couched in legal language and partners play games with the funder - presenting strengths and glossing over weaknesses. Transactional Analysis would then be a better solution than management theory!

Do our funding partners impose ideas from outside?

Closely linked to the above is the style of the funding agency. Does it impose ideas from outside? Does it force strategies that may have worked in other cultures and other countries but are not necessarily relevant to local realities? Does it derive all its professional support from resource persons in its own country or does it try to understand each country's realities and initiate dialogue with resource persons closer to the project situation? Does it stifle local initiative or support the generation of creative solutions by the locals themselves? Does it support collective exploration of local experience among its project partners?

Is our funding partner flexible or bureaucratic in its management style?

Is the planning, organisation and evaluation of projects including funding decisions done in a flexible, participatory way or is the funding agency bureaucratic, imposing all sorts of requirements, reports, forms to be filled, indicators to be provided in a top down, bureaucratic way? The funding agency's field/ project officers can be a major support or block to the process of sustainability. However flexible or participatory the funding agency's management may be, it is at the interface between project officer and project partner that the process succeeds or fails. Orientation of field officers is therefore a major step towards the larger goal of building sustainable linkages.

Are we 'scaling up' due to pressures from our funders?

To expect successful efforts to scale up so that the impact of their efficiency or creativity can reach large numbers is a sensible proposition. But when scaling up, pressures from funders are imposed for extraneous reasons, such as a spirit of competition with other funding agencies, a reallotment or a self imposed diversion of funds to a predetermined objective, or based on naive management theory that what works in 10 villages will now work in a hundred, or even worse, to keep administrative costs of the funding agency low: then these affect the sustainability process greatly. For example, scaling up of operations . from 10 villages to a 100 villages in a year, or from 2 lakhs to 20 lakhs will put pressures on a process that will, inspite of earlier successes, make way for new unprecedented problems. Small is beautiful and creative, and does not necessarily continue when it becomes large! Also a gradual scaling up helps the project to evolve its own realistic dynamics, creating linkages with the community resource groups

and building up supportive funds, gradually making the process more viable in the long run.

AGENCY-GOVERNMENT INTERAC-TION FACTORS

Do we collaborate with, compete with, or confront Government services?

The voluntary agency's own ideology vis-a-vis government programmes can be a major factor in sustainability. Does it collaborate, compete or confront government through its programmes? While all these may be perfectly legitimate in the context of the ideological framework in which the voluntary agency evolves, it does affect its sustainability - especially in terms of relationship or support from government.

Are we an accountable voluntary agency?

An accountable voluntary agency - accountable to the community, to the support groups (including funding), and to the government in the context of legal status etc - is far more sustainable than one that is isolationist in its ethos and world view and ad-hoc in its style of management.

If we collaborate with Government - is it 'critical' or 'co-opted' collaboration?

Collaboration with government is an increasingly possible role because of the increasing recognition of the success and effectiveness of 'voluntary' effort. However there is a danger of co-option into the government system or loss of identity. The agency should therefore critically collaborate which means in practice, collaborating actively but complementing it with continuous feedback about grassroots realities including the community experiences of government programmes and initiatives. Critical collaboration also means choosing programmes that fit with the agency's objectives and building up the space to experiment with alternative methods of functioning.

Is the Government attitude to us at state or local level, one of suspicion or of policing?

Governmental regulations are increasing and there are times when the regulations are based on suspicions of voluntary sector motivations or linkages. At the local level this can often result in government functionaries being threatening or 'policing' in their attitudes. This greatly affects sustainability of the process because vested interests or status quo forces at the community level can often use this as a means to neutralise efforts. A good dialogue relationship with government at all levels is a 'preventive' that is worth investing in. While each agency cannot do this, networks, associations, consultative committee, etc, are good means of ensuring and evolving this relationship. Being active members of such networks and associations therefore helps sustainability.

ACTIONAID DISABILITY NEWS

MONITORING / EVALUATION RE-LATED FACTORS

Have we built good feedback mechanisms from grassroots level upwards in our work?

Good feedback mechanisms at all levels of a project and especially supportive of feedback at the project team - community interface is an investment in sustainability, since it ensures that the process is alive to local problems and emerging constraints if any. Regular feedback also helps to make concurrent or mid course corrections in plans.

Do we focus only on 'successes' or explore 'failures' as well?

Evaluation and monitoring often focus on Strengths and Successes and not Weaknesses or failures. It seldom focuses on available Opportunities and assessment of Threats. Sustainability is greatly enhanced when a process is reflected upon in all these dime sions (SWOT sessions). Reflective evaluation on weaknesses and threats can help evolution of creative alternative plans. Reflection on strengths and opportunities can help build staff morale. Both positive staff morale and creative alternative plans help the sustainability process.

Have we initiated a participatory process in our evaluation strategy?

Evaluation is often thrust on a project/process from outside, with experts coming to study the project. While this may inject a certain objectivity, it also causes insecurity. A participatory form of evaluation helps both project team and members of the beneficiary community to understand the objectives, the processes, the problems and helps evaluation to become a learning experience for the future, thereby greatly enhancing its sustainability.

SUPPORT MECHANISM FACTORS

It has been mentioned earlier that sustainability is often seen only in financial/ economic terms, but needs to be seen in a wider canvas, which have been outlined above. This is however not in any way to reduce the importance of finances or adequate monetary resources to meet our objectives. The attempt is to highlight that funds are an important factor but not a sufficient factor for sustainability.

Is our fund raising system a single source or a multisource one?

Multiple funding partners for activities conducted by an organisation help sustainability. A single source causes much insecurity on a long term, because of the vulnerability that could be caused by a change in relationship or policy. Each funding partner can support one sub-unit so that there is a stake in a specific activity, but funders should also be ready to pool resources for core costs, providing a small percentage of the budget.

ŕ

a²

ACTIONAID DISABILITY NEWS

Do we have a network of supporters or only large institutional grants?

Apart from large grants, voluntary agencies that build up a network of regular volunteers and support through small but regular financial contributions even from individuals, greatly enhance their own long term sustainability. The increased number of people who would be committed to seeing them through a financial crisis or a problem, enhances sustainability.

Do we have Patrons/Friends committed to our growth and development?

Many voluntary agencies initiate the concept of patrons and friends, and because of the legal provisions they also need an executive committee and/or a governing board. Organisations which create these linkages with individuals for notional reasons and accept or even promote passive indifference are compromising their own sustainability. Committed and involved patrons and friends can be a great support in tapping available resources and can support fund raising part - ly. Do our friends and associates include competent technical resource persons as well?

Any organisation that builds up linkages with friends who can be technical resources also help their own sustainability process. Sometimes technical resource or competence is as important a problem solver as adequate funds or managerial competence.

Is the national climate suitable for voluntary effort ?

Finally, but not the least important, is the whole national climate - socio-economic, political and cultural - a contributory factor to sustainability! When there is stability, a sense of well being, a sense of direction and committed visionary leadership, such a climate itself acts as a great support to all types of voluntary effort. On the other hand as in the past two years in the country, when political instability, communal violence, strife and terrorism abound, pessimism sets in, affecting voluntary effort greatly, by paralysing initiative and stifling creativity.

Sustainability therefore is a multi-dimensional concept and it is necessary for voluntary agencies and funding partners to explore a wide variety of factors that contribute to it. By operationalising meaningful strategies to make these factors positive supports and not negative obstacles to the evolving process of voluntary effort, sustainability can be ensured.

Dr. Ravi Narayan

Society for Community Health Awareness, Research and Action Community Health Cell 367, Srinivasa Nilaya, Jakkasandra I Main, I Block, Koramangala Bangalore - 560 034 India

A REVIEW OF RECENT RESEARCH ON CHILDHOOD DISABILITY IN JAMAICA

survey of all children between 2 years and 9

INTRODUCTION

This paper summarises some of the major findings from a study carried out by the Department of Social and Preventive Medicine, University of West Indies and of other papers which have recently been published on the topic of childhood disability.

"Low Cost Methods for the Rapid Identification and Assessment of Childhood Disability in Jamaica" was a collaborative study conducted between 1987 and 1989, as part of the International Epidemiological Study on Childhood Disability (IESCD). The other collaborators were the Jinnah Post Graduate Medical Centre, Karachi, the Uni tity of Dhaka, Bangladesh and the Ger... e Sergievsky Centre of Columbia University, New York.

AIMS

The aims of the study were:

to develop an improved, low cost method for the assessment of the prevalence and risk of disability in children

to devise and test instruments and approaches relevant for the primary aim, and to assess the competence of community workers (CWs) to identify and categorise disability, measure its impact and identify risk factors

to develop a standardised professional assessment protocol, and

to develop appropriate intervention and prevention strategies

MATERIALS AND METHOD

The study used a two stage design : a community

years in the selected areas, and professional assessment of all "positive cases" along with a sample of "negatives". The Jamaican project aimed to study 10,000 children between the ase of 2 and 9 years in 3

children between the age of 2 and 9 years in 3 chosen sites in Clarendon. However, only two communities and 5500 children could be screened because of the high rate of positive cases (15%) based on the Ten Question (TQ) screen. Field work began in January 1987 with a key informant study (1), along with the pilot study and testing of instruments. Eight field workers were trained in July 1987 for the purpose of the houseto-house survey in central and south Clarendon. This was completed a year later. Professional assessments were done in four clinics each week by a doctor and a psychologist, with CWs doing the screening for vision, hearing and nutrition. A follow-up of 3000 children who had been assessed was done between September and October 1988, 9 months after the first assessment.

The records used to collect the data are given in Table 1.

	Table I
Numbers	Description of the records
0.1.1.1.0	

Community Survey Forms

......

- 2900 Household forms with social and demographic data on the families of the 2-9 year olds.
- 3350 Mother-child forms with social, biological and obstetric data of the mothers of all the 2-9 year old children.
- 5500 Ten Question Screen (TQ), a questionnaire designed to detect six types of disabilities (cognitive, hearing, speech, visual, motor disabilities and epilepsy).

The questionnaire included other basic data about the child.

5500

Community worker (CW) assessment forms, where they answered questions as to the presence, type and severity of the disability and whether the child needed professional assessment.

A random 8% were pre-marked to get a control sub-sample.

- 1219 Activities of Daily Living Questionnaire (ADLQ), which consisted of 20 questions concerning self help, social, language, motor and learning handicaps. This questionnaire was used only for those children designated for professional assessment (TQ positive or part of the random sample).
- 170 Individual Programme Plans (IPP), made by the CW in discussion with the parent and based on the handicaps identified in the ADLQ. If there was no handicap, there was no IPP.

Professional Assessment Forms

994 Medical assessment forms consisting of a detailed paediatric and developmental history with a semistructured checklist for enquiring about all disabilities, a simple functional assessment, and a neurological, nutritional, visual (Landholdt C) and hearing screening using a Maico audiometer.

> A diagnostic sheet, including the impairments and disabilities identified, the medical diagnosis, and referral needs.

994 Psychological assessment forms which incorporated the Child Disability Questionnaire (CDQ) on all children, the Den-



SOCIETY FOR PARTICIPATORY RESEARCH IN ASIA

NEWSLETTER

April-June-1991

EDITORIAL

WHITHER SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT ?

Changes in the Indian economy during the last one month are being viewed with apprehension, hope and even despair. It can be safely said that most of us will be around to see their impact on the country. It is clear that the government is seeking loans from the International Monetary Fund to the tune of \$5000-\$7000 million (Rs. 1,25,00 crores-Rs.1,75,00 crores), so as to facilitate adjustments in the domestic economy. We have witnessed two rounds of devaluation in rapid succession which has caused the value of the Rupee to fall by around 20%. A major change in the import-export policy has been initiated and, last but not the least, a revamped industrial policy has emerged. This package has been presented to the nation on the same day as the proposed budget for 1991-'92.

The economy is going through a crisis. One does not have to be an expert/economist to feel the impact of inflation, expanding unemployment, stagnant or decreasing productivity. This has occurred because the country has been living beyond its means in the last decade, and the government has lost effective control over macro-economic balances. Consequently, we have been facing over-increasing budgetary deficits and sustained inflationary pressures; savings have plateaued; and the trade balance has deteriorated, despite an unprecedented growth in world exports. An indication of this problem is provided by the perpetual internal and external debt burden on the government.

Besides the revenue crisis, we are also faced with a much bigger problem of structural crisis. One of the symptoms of this is, the lack of will and the inability of the government to control non-plan expenditure, which has led to burgeoning revenue deficits. Intensifying infrastructural constraints is another structural crisis which is imposed on account of the resource crunch faced by the various utility sectors and, in part, because of the rampant inefficiency in the public sector.

A near total breakdown of performance based rewards and entitlement systems in large segments of our economy is also a bottleneck. Inability to generate additional employment in the organised secondary sector; continuing reduction in the country's share of global exports; slowdown in investment in capital and intermediate goods; increased inflationary pressure (despite a better than expected agricultural performance over the last three years), are few other symptoms of the structural crisis. The "green revolution" techniques don't seem to be able to expand agricultural productivity anymore.

Since the time the Indian planning process was initiated, the major emphasis has been on maximizing our economic growth. This has been the broad focus of all our planning exercises. A mere "lip service" has been provided to the issues of equity and social justice. We are simply following the "trickle-down" theory of development. Here, one assumes that the benefits of rapid economic growth will percolate down to those segments of the economy which are not directly involved in such growth.

The present reforms, as envisaged by the government, seem to continue the trickle-down approach. The entire emphasis of these reforms is on the gearing-up of our industrial growth. Employment and social justice have not even got their due share of lip-service, this time around. Given all these indicators, the eighth five year plan will also be reformulated by this government and the stillborn draft (with its emphasis on employment), will die its natural death.

An argument in defence of the "trickle down" approach is that India has not been able to achieve a threshold rate of economic growth so as to allow the benefits to trickle down. With the structural reforms that will be (or are being) carried out, the thrust is to attain this threshold level. The benefits would, through the interlinkages between the various sectors, trickle down. But, what is that threshold level? Can the restructuring of the industrial sector allow the benefits, if any, to percolate down to the unorganised sector of our economy? Can the emphasis on export growth lead the country to its overall growth? Are not reforms required in that major area where most of India dwells and feeds off?

The new environment that these reforms seek is to create a more open economy, with more intense interlinkages with the world economy. It can also make the economy more susceptible to external shocks and pressures. We have not been exposed to these earlier to such an extent due to our insular policies. It would also perpetuate a greater divide between India and "Bharat", unless specific remedial measures are undertaken to rectify this dualism. But, there does not seem to be a motivating force, such as an IMF loan, to inspire the government to do something constructive in this direction.

How can there be any economic growth (sustained increase in per capita income over a period of time) without integrating all the segments of the economy? Sooner or later, the economy is bound to run into bottlenecks. An integrated, wholistic approach is required if the government is genuinely interested in solving the mess that the economy is in, nowadays. It is the issue of economic development on a sustainable basis, that the planners should tackle rather than toeing the one-track emphasis on economic growth.

REPORTAGE

Occupational Health and Safety

PRIA organised a regional training programme on occupational health and safety at Amar Bhawan Rourkela from April 9-11, 1991. About 29 participants from various organisations attended the workshop. The objective of the workshop was to develop an understanding about occupational health and safety.

Training of Trainers Programme

Phase II ofRound VII of the Training of Trainers programme was held at Sneh Jyoti, Bangalore during April 16-23, 1991. Twenty nine participants attended this training programme. The main objectives were to sharpen competencies in designing a training programme, to enhance trainer skills in conducting training, use of various learning-training methods and to build a deeper understanding of key content areas in training. A report has been prepared by PRIA.

Management of Women's Economic Activities

A camp for women leaders, representing different women's groups in West Bengal was organised at Taj Mahal, in collaboration with Development Dialogue, during April 25th. to 28th., 1991. Twenty five women leaders attended this camp. Participants tried to develop their understanding on various aspects of management of women's economic activities.

PRIA organised a training programme in Hindi for functionaries representing NGOs, at Gandhi Bhavan, Pune during May 7-14, 1991. Thirty four participants from sixteen organisations attended the programme. The focus was to enable participants to strengthen their Managerial Capacities in managing women's economic activities. A Report is being prepared in Hindi.

A Camp was organised for women leaders of the primary Mahila Samities of Tejpur Dist. Mahila Samiti, Assam, from June 19th. to 21st., 1991. Twenty eight women leaders representing twenty one Mahila Samities attended this camp. The main focus was trying to develop and enhance an understanding of the management of women's economic activities.

Training of Mahagujarat Kamgar Union

PRIA conducted a two day training programme for Mahagujrat Kamgar Union of Baroda on 1-2, June, 1991. It was the first phase of three phased training programme which will cover the various mines of trade union eg. strength, unity, broader approach towards problems, effective negotiation and bargaining, various Acts and Regulations. In this training programme 15 members of the Union participated.

Slide Show

PRIA organised a lecture cum slide show presented by Dr.D.N.Kaliya of P.G.D.A.V. College, Shri Nivas Puri, New Delhi, on June 18, 1991 at PRIA. The slide show was on "Pollution in Yamuna River and Traditional Water Supply Systems of Delhi". About 30 participants attended the programme.

100 Crore live in Poverty

More than 100 crore people in developing countries live in poverty. In World Development Report 1990, the World Bank analyzes global poverty. (<u>Utusan Konsumer, Malavsia)</u>

Demand for a Separate Legislation for Construction Workers

The first national conference of construction workers, organised by the National Campaign Committee was held at Gandhi Darshan in Delhi on July 2nd, 1991. The focus was on the need to regulate employment in the huge and unorganised construction sector. This forms the second largest labour force in the nation (the largest force being agricultural labourers and farmers). They have no legislation to protect them or regulate employment, taking into account the unique nature of their job. For one, the nature of the construction industry is unorganised. Second, there is no permanent employer - employee relationship. Third, in other industries the product is mobile while the producer is stable, while in the construction industry it is the other way round. These make any legislations immensely difficult to implement. The NCC has suggested establishing tripartite construction labour boards at the National, State and District levels. The primary function of these boards would be to regulate employment.

Regional Training of Trainers

Phase II of Round I of the Training of Trainers Programme in Hindi, organised by Sahbhagi Shikshan Kendra, Lucknow, was held at Dak Pathar, Dehradun, (U.P.), during 19-26 June, 1991. 19 participants attended this programme. The main objective were to sharpen competencies in designing a training programme, to enhance trainer skills in conducting training, use of various learning-training methods and to build a deeper understanding of key content areas in training. A report is being perpared. For details contact : Sahbhagi Shikshan kendra, 13/96, Munshi Pulia, Indira Nagar, Lucknow-226 016, U.P.

NEWS OF INTEREST

The Imperialism of Northern NGOs

During an international conference on Third World development, a Latin American participant stood up and said: "Once upon a time, we were a free nation, with our own culture and development process. Then, the Spanish came and conquered us. We were defeated because they had horses. Later, our people fought the Spanish until we gained independence. But are we really independent? Even now foreign countries dictate to us economically, culturally, politically. And they do not need horses to conquer us now, because we have NGOs."

VIEWS OF INTEREST

For some people, especially members of nongovernment organisations, this may sound like an exaggeration. It is not. The role of NGOs in promoting people's welfare and rights needs to be questioned. So does the notion of imperialism. Not only are many Third World NGOs agents of imperialism, but there is also an imperialistic attitude in the relationship between First World and Third World NGOs.

Anybody working in the development and environment field recognises issues such as sustainable development, social forestry, management of national parks, women in development and, most recently, the conservation of biological diversity. It was First World NGOs that put these issues on the agenda without consulting us. Third World NGos, including my own, took them up gladly because they spell money and support.

A good example of agenda-setting was the way a prestigious Northern NGO devised its campaign for "sustainable logging in tropical forests by the year 1995", For people in this NGO, conservation is a business; for Third World people, it is a matter of life and death. No sustainable logging in an economic, ecological, cultural or democratic sense has ever been proven. Yet these so-called conservation experts dared to say that there should be sustainable logging by 1995.

The concept of sustainable logging was challenged by a friend at a recent meeting in Australia. "sustainable for whom?" she asked. For the logging companies, perhaps. But for the people, logging becomes sustainable only if they have control over resources and are given secure rights to the land.

In my everyday activities, I often ask myself why we should spend our precious time, energy and resources on issues such as the Tropical Forestry Action Plan (TFAP), the International Tropical Timber Organisation (ITTO), the conservation of biological diversity, buffer zones around national parks and a dozen other programmes.

Most Australian NGOs receive money from the Australian International Development Assistance Bureau (AIDAB). They cease to ask questions about how AIDAB uses its money in the Third World. They refuse to criticise oppressive governments supported by their own government for fear of not being given funds. They do not mind operating in countries where human rights do not exist or are constantly violated.

To get support from them is to go by their book. And to ' go by their book is to steer clear of all critical issues such as human rights, land disputes and democracy.

The approach of US NGOs is even less comprehensible. I have always maintained that they are more concerned about projects and campaigns than about the actual. needs of Third World NGOs and communities. Many receive money from the US Agency for International Development. USAID is a big agency. No small Third World NGO can cope with its technical requirements such as reports in English, sophisticated account-keeping, and strict project deadlines.

Because they follow USAID priorities, US NGOs are prevented from supporting innovative actions and end up doing trivial work such as income-generation projects which hardly change the condition of the people.

When I expressed disappointment at this, I was told by a member of a US NGO with officers in Indonesia: "We are in no position to change our ways. If this does not suit the indigenous NGOs, they can look for other partners". And yet, they and other First World NGOs can secure financial support in the name of "having partners in the Third World".

First world NGOs often arrogantly asks. "How can we help you?" When I say: "Educate your own public," they claim that it is what they have been doing. But they have no answer when I say that the public should be educated to the point of taking action against their own government, the transnational companies and the oppressive system. A campaign for stopping military aid, for instance, would be welcome by pro-democracy groups in Third World countries. As would be another on the impact of Western-dominated international Trade.

The time has come for them to put emphasis on action-oriented public education in the North rather than to continue supporting projects that maintain the status quo of oppression. ref.- Hira Jhamtani works for SKEPHI, (The People's Network for Forest Conservation in Indonesia).

1

RESOURCE MATERIALS

We Make the Road by Walking : Conversation on Education &

Social Change

In December, 1987, Myles Horton and Paulo Freire, two pioneers of education for social change, came



together to 'talk' a book about their experiences and ideas. Though they came from different environments, they shared a vision and a history of using participatory education as a crucible for empowerment

of the poor and powerless. Here, they discuss the nature of social Change and empowerment and their own individual work. For both men, ereal liberation is achieved through •popular participation. The themes they discuss illuminate problems faced ·by educators and activists around the world who are concerned with linking participatory education to the practice of liberation and social change. How could two men, working in such different social spaces and times, arrive at similar ideas and methods ? These conversations answer that • guestion in rich detail and engaging anecdotes, and show how, underlyeing the philosophy of both is the idea that theory emanates from practice, and that knowledge grows from and •is a reflection of social experience. (For details contact : Highlander Re-

search & Education Center,1959 Highlander way, New Market, Tennessee-37820 U.S.A.)

A Moment of Truth This book bears historical witness to

the Workers' Autonomous Federa-



tion (WAF) that rose to prominence during the 1989 Democracy Movement in China. It looks deeper than the established global media analyses which generally pres-

ent a rudimentary picture of what

seemed no more than another student

movement. It ventures into the of ultimately more significant role China's workers, and particularly the trade unions, in the unrest of 1989. The material in the book reveals a serious contradiction between the governments' social rhetoric on the one hand, and the realities of daily life and the consciousness of the people on the other. It includes a collection of profiles of some of the leaders of WAF. and consists of interviews with organisers of the WAF. It is hoped that this will give the readers an opportunity to judge the true character of these members, described by the chinese authorities as "social scum", "hooligans", and "thugs", and also give a clear understanding of their role in political development in China. (For details contact: AMRC Ltd., 444 Nathan Road, 8-B Kowloon, Hong Kong.)

Understanding Voluntary Organisations : Guidelines for Donors

Voluntary development organisations have demonstrated substantial comparative advantage in developing countries. Their capabilities are a function of their values, special skills, small size, limited resources, flexibility, and freedom from political constraints. Their weaknesses are a function of many of the same characteristics. In this paper on what makes NGOs tick, L. David Brown and David C. Korten suggest that it is inappropriate to critique the voluntary organisations, Government organisations or the commercial organisations. In relating to NGOs, they say that donors should avoid the danger of equating small with simple. The strongest of VOs and POs respond to a good deal more than financial incentives. (For details contact: Dave Brown, IDR, 20 Park plaza, Suite 1103, Boston - 02116-4399, U.S.A.

Education for Democratic Participation

This work presented as a Ph.d dissertation to the University of Cape Town in South Africa, focuses on the development of non-formal education theory within community organisations. This book deals specifically with self-education within a set of organisations in Cape Town where a primary concern was the promotion of democratic participation among their mem-



bers. The work contains three rich and diverse case • studies which give important insights . into the working of • . community or-. ganisations. A participatory research methodology was used. • The strengths and weakness of .

this approach have also been highlighted. (For details contact : Dr. Shirley Walters, Centre for Adult and Continuing Education, (CACE) University of Western Cape, Bellville.

Rural Development in Eastern and North Eastern India

This book published by the Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta is a • compilation of the papers presented in the seminar on Rural Develop-. ment which brought together a number of researchers from Universities, Research Institutes, professional organisations as well as practitioners from government and non -govern-. ment organisations. The seminar. provided an insight into some of the difficulties in effective implementa-. tions of different programmes for the development of the rural people and rural section. This volume contains . thirty three papers covering a number of areas such as agrarian relations and social change, performance of different rural development programmes, issues relating to land . reforms, rural development, strategies in relation to socio-economic. development and eradication of poverty etc. (For details contact : Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta, P.O. • Joka, Dist.24, Parganas (South), West Bengal.

Society for Participatory Research In Asia (PRIA) 42, Tughlakabad Institutional Area New Delhi - 110 062,

.

Nowever, it is not just the religious projudice that can precipitate such conflict and instability, any ethno-cultural divide can. whether this be religion or language, or whatever. And these as we know are more 'con. ! .cted' than 'real'. The question to ask really is, whether religious commitment is linked to political intolerance?

Earlier studies based on the correlation of psycho-socio profiles and attitudes seem to indicate a positive relationship between the two. But later more fine-tuned analyses began to distinguish between an authentic commitment to religious values, and an identification with a religious group mobilising to defend or promote its interests, articulated in terms of religious symbols and myths, though they may not really related to them. Religion here becomes a mobilising ideology. The case for religious influence in politics, however can be made in terms of the support it gives and the stabilising influence it has on the civic values that support a democratic participative process and public morality. But then not every kind of religious belief or practice makes for such a humanising faith. Only a regorous critique

posedly secular country, then what agenda does this suggest to us in our present crisis? It is here that we need to do some critical soul-searching. How can we isolate religious institutions from being politicised in particular from being co-opted to political party interests? How do we prevent religious symbols and myths from being appropriated for electoral politics? Can we expose how genuine group interests are sometimes obfuscated and misdirected, when they are articulated in terms of religion, for narrow chauvinistic gains? How can our religious traditions be made to support and promote civic and democratic values?

Positive and constructive answers to such questions will not be found in alien, implanted models of church-state legislation. There must be a much more urgent agenda for us on our own ground realities. For, just as we cannot have a genuinely democratic government, without democratising our social institutions and ridding our communities and families of authoritarianism, so too we cannot hope to have a truly secular state unless we secularise our civil society, humanising a humanising faith. Only a rigorous critique our religious traditions and purging them of of religion can assure this. Fundamentary obscurantism and prejudice, whether this be obscurantism or religious nationality of the public practice or private belief, tainly does not. The complete separation field of religion political ethics tame out religious or there and politics seems hardly possible, even if some of provide a matter values – religious or other-this were destrable. For the religious potters, wise. Indeed what we do need now is a and commitments of a group will tend to find.^{N N} deeper human sing faith and not a chauvinist public mid political expression. If this relates are religious iteology, more 'raj-niti' and less tion: is obtains in an attigenee and MGA light and our religious traditions and purging them of

Towards Sustainable Development.

Vasant K Bawa

How Much is Enough?: The Consumer Society and the Future of the Earth by Alax Durning: The Worldwatch Environmental Alert Series, WW Norton and Company, New York, 1992.

State of the Forld: A Worldwatch Institute Report on Progress toward a Sustainable Society by Lester R Brown and others; W W Norton and Company, New York, 1993, 1994.

Gandhian Holistic Economics by Shashi Prabha Sharma: Gandhian Studies and Peace Research Series: Concept Publishing Company, New Delhi; 1992.

SOON after the ending of the Global Conference on Environment and Development held at Rio de Janeiro, Brazil in Juae 1992, a new took received worldwide headlines. For the first time, UNI reported on July 28, a reputed American research institute direetly blamed the "conspictious consumerism and atfluent life-style of the Americans" for being the major cause of the environmental damage, next only to population growth in African and Asian countries. The Worldwatch Institute, a Washington, DC-based environmentel research organisation says that "the consister life-style born in America and now emulated by a billion people worldwide causes the lion's share of ecological ills. Yet, consumption is usually overlooked in environmental discussions"

away products, meat and junk-tood diet add up to the most environmentally destructive way of life yet devised", says Alan Thein Durning, author of How Much by Enough?; The Convolute Sources and the Future of the Earth. In this 'consumerist culture' the Americans are engaged in a truitless attempt to find happiness in material things and in the race for aches baye lost family values, leisure and social relations. He called upon individuals to turn to the family and community "as it has been proved by wise men from the Buddha to Mohammed - that money cannot buy happiness". Communities should also restrain advertising and other pro-consumption forces to bring about a change in the althuent life-style which alone could

"Our caus, suburbs, shopping malls, throw-

ensure an environmentally sound earth. The author strongly advocated a broad social movement to create a culture of permanence a way of life that can contain use of ecologically destructive things and cultivate deeper, non-material, so irces of fulfilment that can bring happiness.

Durning pointed out that over a few short generations, "the affluent, who constitute one-fifth of humanity have become car drivers, television watchers, junk-food eaters, mall shoppers and it rowaway buyers". Meanwhile, the rest of the world feels that the time has at last come 1 ir it also to achieve the same kind of consumer life-style. The study pinpoints the trends that promote consumerism: expansion of the advertising industry, substitution o shopping malls for traditional city centres rapid international spread of commercial television, continuation of government subsidies to environmentally harmful industries and the persistence of the belief that only the ever-increasing consumption can ensure full employment.

Durning felt that the conspicuous consumer class - one billion people, mostly in industrialised nations - are responsible for. the release of all the chone-depleting carbons (CFCs), two-thir... of all greenhouse gases, and other pollutants that cause acid rain, pesticides or even radioactive waste. On the other hand he vas all praise for the middle-income class living in Asia and Latin America which causes ir less harm. Their diet of grains and le al produce, their modest stocks of durable: goods all exemplify a life-style that is env conmentally sound. Advanced technologies, ould make that lifestyle more comfortable but its basic outlines define the environmental ideal, he added. "Ultimately", he said. the linked fate of humanity and the natu at realm depend on us consumers. We car Jurtail use of ecologically destructive things and cultivate deeper non-material segrees of fulfilment that bring happiness, or we can abrogate our responsibilities and let dur life-style ruin the earth.'

How did this remarcable change come about, so that even a suber and widely respected US organisation could identify itself with a view that had hither to been considered as radical, woolly and left wing? And what are the implications of this change in the world climate of opinion for the Indian elite, not to speak of the middle class, which is just beginning to say Hello' to 'Zindagi' (life)? This class is dependent on refrigerators and two-wheelers, aspires to having cars, washing machines, air-conditioners and microwave ovens Sall items which add to global warning and afact the ozone layer. We in India cannot always blame all our problems on the industrialised countries, and must eventually then the searchlight mwards

The Worldwatch Institute in Washington, DC has become an important institution during the 10 years of it: existence. Its annual State of the World reports 'On Progress

Economic and Political Weekly - October 15, 1994

V. 29, NO 42.

toward a Sustainable Society' are balanced, well-researched, and widely read. It is published by commercial publishers in some 27 languages including Spanish, Portuguese, Rench, Italian, Chinese, Japanese, Arabic, Indocesian, German, Polish and Russian. American universities have appreciated its "integrative, interdisciplinary approach". It is prescribed as a textbook or as supplementary reading for courses in many fields. In a survey conducted by Pennsylvania State University, 235 'environmental leaders' ranked State of the World third on the alltime list of the 500 "most influential environinental books", next to Sand County Almanac by Aldo Leopold and Silent Spring by Rachel Carson

Articles in the 1993 edition of State of the World cover such issues as 'Facing Water Scarcity', 'Reviving Coral Recfs', 'Rediscovering Rail', 'Preparing for Peace', 'Reconciling Trade and the Environment', and 'Shaping the Next Industrial Revolution'. Articles which have special significance for third world countries are 'Closing the Gender Gap in Development', 'Supporting Indigenous Peoples', and 'Providing Energy in Developing Countries'. The 1994 edition also raises basic issues like 'Redesigning the Forest Economy', 'Safeguarding Oceans'. 'Reshaping the Power Industry' and 'Using Computers for the Environment'.

During the 10 years that the report has been coming out, there has been a more precise quantification of the loss of the world's forest resources, first noted in 1984, the progressive depletion of the protective ozone layer, which had first been reported in 1985, the increase in global warming, the threat to three-fourths of the 9,000 bird species in the world, the dangers of nuclear power and the population explosion. The attempts made by the signatories to the Montreal convention of 1987 to sharply reduce the production of the family of chemicals threatening the ozone layer did evidently lead to some results, we learn to our surprise. Between 1988, the peak year of production, and 1991, world production of Chlorofluorocarbons fell by an astounding 46 per cent. This was partly due to the fact that DuPont, the leading manufacturers of CFC's, had already been "developing CFC substitutes which would be at least as profitable as the "emicals being phased out" (State of the World, 1993, p 186). This last statistic makes us realise that there is a good deal that can be done through the regulation of manufacturing activity, even in the most 'advanced' (often definable as the most polluting) economics. The pressure of environmental lobbies in the US has been so great, it is sometimes stated, that it has succeeded in pricing nuclear power stations out of the market.

However, according to the Worldwatch Institute's own account, the past 10 years have not seen much change in the situation. Not only has the "concentration of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere climbed higher each year", but "almost every new assessment of the ozone layer's health indicates accelerating depletion". Apart from this, "the earth's forests continue to shrink, its deserts continue to expand, and a third of all crop land continues to erode excessively. The number of plant and animal species in the planet is diminishing." Perhaps the institute is unable to go into some of the more fundamental causes of the environmental crisis, such as the dependence of the American economy on the automobile, and on cheap gas or petrol, which also dictates many aspects of American foreign policy towards the Gulf countries, and to the world at large.

While the analysis in the Worldwatch reports is at a high level of sophistication. the reasoning in How Much Is Enough? (which, as we have seen, is written by the same people) is politically naive and simplistic. It seems to imply that by exhorting the elites to give up their high consumption life-styles, such a development is likely to take place. The whole argument was put much better by Ivan Illich in Towards a History of Needs (Nev York, Bantam Books, 1980), as follows: "The first enslaving illusion is the idea that people are born to be consumers and that they can attain any of their goals by purchasing goods and services. This illusion is due to an educated blindness to the worth of use-values in the total economy... The illusion that economic models can ignore use-values springs from the assumption that those activities which we designate by intransitive verbs can be indefinitely replaced by institutionally defined staples referred to as nouns: 'education' substituted for 'I learn', 'health care' for 'I heal', 'transportation' for 'I move', 'television' for 'I play'" (pp 41-42).

The economic analysis in the Durning book is practically confined to the 4th chapter, entitled 'The Environmental Costs of Consumption'. The World Bank economist Herman Daly is quoted on page 59 as saying that "simply stopping the growth in rates of global pollution, ecological degradation, and habitat destruction - not reducing those rates. as is clearly necessary - would require within four decades a twenty-fold improvement in the environmental performance of current technology". Even this assumes that (1) industrial countries halt their growth of per capita consumption, allowing the developing countries to catch up, and (2) that world population no more than doubles during that period. This is obviously a tall order. (Daly has since then come out with an important book, edited jointly with Kenneth Townsend, entitled Valuing the Earth: Economics, Ecology Ethics, MIT Press, Cambridge, Mass, 1993, reviewed in Worldwatch, Vol 6, No 4, July-August 1993, pp 39-40.)

How del the socialist countries tackle the problem? Not too well, so far as the Soviet Union and eastern Europe are concerned. Top-heavy bureaucracies laid down wellmeaning provisions, which were not enforced in practice. Pollution in the former Soviet Umon and eastern Europe is at dangerously high levels. (See for example, two articles in the journal, Worldwatch, Lester Brown, 'The Aral Sea Going, Going...', Vol 4, No 1, January-February 1991, pp 20-27, and Nicholas Lenssen, update on 'Chernobyl, Firsthand', Vol 7, No 1, January-February 1994, p 8.)

China can be cited as a country which had evolved during the 50s and 60s a model of development which combined employment orientation with utilisation of human waste, the recycling of garbage, and its conversion into fertiliser. The low-cost, high-employment, recycling-oriented economic pattern of the Mao era has, however, given way to a high-technology, private enterprise, wealthproducing pattern, at least in southern China, based on the Hong Kong model. It is likely to be as environmentally damaging in the long run as the western model, although not perhaps as damaging as the east European model might have been.

GA OHIAN ALTERNATIVE .

Some wourd feel it inappropriate to consider the Gaudhian economic model in the context of the present debate. The ecological crisis had not reached its present magnitude during Gandhi's lifetime, and his concern for the main enance of traditional values while transforming rural society seems to have no direct connection with the global economic crisis. We have to note, however, his statemen / which was quoted by the Indian prime minister at the Rio summit) that the world has enough for everyone's need, but not for anyone's greed. If the British empire required to exploit such a large part of the world to montain its standard of living, he asked, how much would India require? That these are not isolated remarks, but constitute the core of his philosophy, is clear from the manner in which one of his closest disciples, J C Kumarappa, formulated these views in detail in the Indian context. (See his book, The Econo ny of Permanence, Sarva Seva Sangh Pralashan, Varanasi, 1984.)

The Garshian model has been put forth once more in a volume, based on a PhD thesis, by Shashi Prabha Sharma, entitled Gandhian Holistic Economics. This volume constitutes a valuable introduction for those who are unfamiliar with the philosophical foundations of Gandhian economics. Quoting the late V K R V Rao, the author puts forth Gandhi's ideas as an alternative which could overcome the failures of both capitalisin and communisin, to a world "attracted by the possibility that the circle can be squared with econemic growth, social justice, full employment, economic and social equality, political democracy and individual freedoms all forming components of a harmonious social order" (p 21). The second chapter contains a reasoned critique of the basic paradigm underlying modern economics, while the third outlines the economic crisis of the present day, citing problems like the depletion of non-renewable resources, the need to maintain an ecological balance, inequalities of income, unemployment,

Economic and Political Weekly October 15, 1994

V. 29, No 42

dehumanisation and the rest. In this context, Sharma cites some of the writings of the Americ in biologist, Barry Commoner, the British economist, E.F.Schumacher (whose ideas were formulated at hast partly in India, under the influence of Jaya Prakash Narayan), ar. J the Club of Rome report (pp. 47-56.) She puts forth as an answer to the crisis the Gandhian holistic approach, which seeks to reconcile 'economic ends' with 'holistic means'. To those familiar with Gandhian thought, there is little that is new in the volume, although the case is put with accuracy and simplicity.

What one misses in the volume is an analysis of the implications of the Gandhian approach for the present world crisis. With Marxists often at a loss to explain current global trends, or to provide answers to the crisis, and with capitalism facing internal contradictions, one would have expected the Gandhian economists to be in the forefront of new economic policy-making exercises.

One has become used to the lip-service paid to Gandhi's ideas by public figures. Sometimes an economist would go further, as did the late V K R V Rao in his Foreword to a book by Shanti S Gupta, The Economic Philosophy of Mahatma Gandhi (Ashok Publishing How . Delhi, no date, 1968-69?). He said there that tis offician economic ideas "are going to influence descutticial economic policy", h.e. among other factors, to the "hard facts of Indian economy such as dearth of capital, implications of foreign aid, dominance of unemployment in rural areas, and consequent waste of labour power, the Imperative need for economic improvement, the example of New China in the skilled use of labour power ...

It is unusual to come across a direct attack on Gandhi's ideas such as the following: 'The Gandhian path is not an alternative path of reaching the goal of economic development which the country has pursued in the past 30 years. It is a path leading to an alternative goal of human life and existence; a human society which is unmoved and immovable, unchanged and unchangeable, using the same kind of plough as existed a thousand years ago, living in the same kind of cottages as there were in times unmemorial and educating its people on the same system as ever before; a society which limits and minimises its material needs and one in which every one earns his daily bread by a full day's physical labour seeking happiness 15 a mental condition detached from the objective material conditions of life. I shall not say that goal is necessarily utopian. I have a simpler point, namely, that the Gandhian goal is not acceptable. If one is alking in the name of the common man and rying to meet his aspirations, it is important o recognise that the Gandhian goal is not clevant" (V M Dandekar, 'Gandhian Ecoomic System: A Path to Non-Economic ioals' In B C Das and G P Mishra, Gandhi · Today's India, Ashish Publishing House, iew Delhi, 1979, pp 91-92.

40

.

It is difficult to refute Dandekar's analysis, based as it is on a study of Hind Swaraj, which, as he points out, Gandhi never repudiated. As against this view, however, we have the important study by Amritananda Das, entitled *Foundations of Gandhian Economics* (Allied Publishers, Bombay 1979), which seeks to put forth a 'Gandhian model of development relevant to the present day, including such concepts as investment patterns and foreign trade. Aziz however feels that such models would deviate from ''Gandhi's laudable goal of a non-exploitative economic system'' (p. 96)

Among the problem which have been neglected by Gandhia, economists is the impact of population growth on pollution. In spite of its adverse effects on the environment, could we have fed our burgeoning population with out the green revolution and its contribution to the food production of the country? Narmada may be harmful, but will small dams provide adequate irrigation for the countryside? What will this alternative require in terms of investment patterns, and what will it achieve in terms of employment potential? Will such a thrust slow down the rush to the metropolitan cities, and develop small and medium towns instead?

Considering the strength of the interest in alternative models of development by those wishing to avoid the pitfalls both of capitalism and socialism, one wishes Indian economists would apply their minds to these problems in greater numbers, and help evolve a developmental model which would tace the issues raised by the global ecological crisis, as well as the problem of distribution, which clearly is not going to be solved by the globalisation pattern which holds the field today.

An important article by Ramachandra Guha in the EPW ('Prehistory of Indian Environmentalism: Intellectual Traditions', January 4-11, 1992, pp 57-63) highlighted the contribution of precursors of modern Indian environmentalism, men like J C-Kumarappa, Patrick Geddes, Radhakámal Mukerjee, and Verrier Elwin, "Kumarappa", Guha says, "was virtually the only economist of his generation to question the centralised and resource-intensive path of development adopted in independent India... Following Gandhi too in questioning the reign of modern man, Kumarappa went on to challenge modern civilisation for disembodying the economy from its ethical and cultural moorings - a decade before Karl Polanyi was to lend intellectual respectability to such criticism" (pp 58-59).

There seems little doubt that J C Kumarappa and others who developed the Gandhian economic model deviated from Mahatma Gandhi's views as stated in Hind Swaraj. While they were loyal to the basic philosophy of Gandhi, they evidently telt it was not necessary to accept literally every word that Gandhi ever said or wrote. In an article entitled 'Gandhian Economic System: Its Relevance to Contemporary India', Abdul Aziz of the Institute of Social and Economic Change, Bangalore, draws a distinction between "Gandhi's economic system" and "the Gandhians' economic system". He argues that the latter strategy "envisages a path for growing rather than a stagnant economy as envisaged by Gandhi", as it provides for "an appropriate rate of savings for future growth of the economy" and of employment opportunities. There is a clearcut link between production and consumption centres, and one cannot be allowed to outstrip the other.

Abdul Aziz seems to be morthodox Gandhi follower, rejecting what he calls "the Gandhian path of development" for "deviating from Gandhi's laudable goal of a nonexploitative economic system", by seeking to "divert a portion of the resources to high capital-intensive projects with a view to ensuring high savings rate, nd future growth" (Abdul Aziz in V T Patil (ed), Studies on Gandhi, Sterling Publishers, New Delhi, 1983, pp 95-96.)

One may concede that Gandhi's own views have been at least partly outdated by events (his views on birth control and prohibition, for example, need to be re-examined). However, it is no longer acceptable to reject all Gandhian economic ideas simply on the ground that technology has changed beyond recognition in the last two hundred years, and more so since Gandhi's death. The importance of the environmental question clearly makes it essential to consider alternative models which are not based on the "latest technology", in which our bureaucrats and industrialists have such touching faith.

Bagaram Tulpule, who del vered the Kunda Datar Memorial Lecture at the Gokhale Institute of Politics and Ecoromics, Pune in 1989 ('Technology against Poverty or Poverty through Technology?') argued that "technology is not value free, nor neutral to the socio-economic and power structure. It is, therefore, dangerous to adopt it as an ideology or an article of faith ..." We have to choose technologies which are benign, non-polluting, and capable of being utilised in a constructive way, he pointed out. For example, he opposed the use of nuclear power, "as the Greenpeace International and so many others round the world are urging" (p .38).

In the opinion of this writer, we must seriously consider a choice of technology based on criteria other than mere productivity - criterialike environmental impact, the location and widespread distribution of industry, its employment potential, and the extent to which it serves "the last man in the queue, the poorest of the poor in India and the rest of the third world". (See V K Bawa, 'What Kind of Development? Industrialisation, Technology and the Environment' in John S Augustine (ed), Strategies for Third World Development, Sage Publications, New Dethi, 1989, p 150. These ideas are further developed in V K Bawa (ed), Environment and Development: A Gandhian Approach, B R Publications, New Delhi.)



CATEGORIES OF

MEMBERSHIP OF SPEQL

- a) Ordinary Annual Membership (Individual) Rs. 50/- Per annum.
- b) Life Membership (Individual) Rs. 500/- Per annum.
- c) Corporate or Institutional Annual Membership Rs. 1000/ Per annum.
- d) Corporate or Institutional Permanent Membership Rs. 10,000/-
- e) Student Membership : Rs. 25/- Per annum. (Associate)

Note: Members of SPEQL will receive one complimentary copy of "Hyderabad Bachao - Save Hyderabad".

SUBSCRIPTION FORM

Hyderabad Bachao - Save Hyderabad

I would like to subscribe to the bi-monthly Hyderabad Bachao - Save Hyderabad for one year. I enclose cash*/ D.D./M.O., for Rs. 30/- in the name of *Society for Preservation* of *Environment and Quality of Life*, 3-6-369/A/20, First Floor, St. No. 1, Himayatnagar, Hyderabad-500 029.

Please send the magazine to the following address:

ature

.

Note : * Please do not send cash by mail.

APPLICATION FOR MEMBERSHIP	5) Areas of Interest	and the state of the second second	
Date To, The Honorary Secretary Society for Preservation of Environment & Quality of Life 3-6-369/A/20, 1st Floor, Street No. 1, Himayatnagar, Hyderabad - 500 029.	 6) (In case of Institutional Members) our Nominee (or Nominees to the Society is/are (not more than two nominees) : I/We agree to abide by the Memorandum of Association and Rule and Regulations of the Society. 		
Sir,	Membership Subscription of Rs.		
I/We request to be admitted as			
Member of the Society for Preservation of Environment & Quality of Life. The following are my/our particulars for your record. 1) Name 2 a) Address & Telephone No :	is being paid by *Cash/D.D. No dated of		
b) Address to which the magazine should be sent (if different from			
above) Telephone No : 3) Profession/Educational Background	Name	Yours faithfully,	
4) Time I/we can spare for the Society, if any	Designation	(Signature)	

COM H 36.5

REPORT OF STATE LEVEL CONSULTATION ON "SUSTAINABLE HEALTH CARE OF PEOPLE"

Devi-Renn And this Vo Renn C. H.C.

AD

29th & 30th JUNE 1995

VENUE : C.D. FOUNDATION

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CENTRE CHETTIPALAYAM, COIMBATORE - 641 201

REPORT PREPARED BY

P. SAMINATHAN A.S. SANKARA NARAYANAN ANNE M.T. ENOS M. MOHAMED USMAN

ORGANISED BY

NETWORKING FOR ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE SYSTEM (NAME - TAMIL NADU)

NETWORKING FOR ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE SYSTEM NAM-TAMILNADU

Dear Friends,

We are happy to share with you this report of Networking for Alternative Medicines Systems (NAM) - Tamil Nadu with a view to get your ideas, comments and suggestions to strengthen the indigenous systems of medicines as people's movement. NAM - Tamil Nadu is a common forum believing in collective effort and process of working together. This has been initiated towards promoting and revitalising alternative (People's) Health Care Systems.

Those who believe in People's Health and interested to have partnership with this effort of working together are welcome to join hands with NAM - Tamil Nadu. This report deals with the Proceeding of the two days "CONSULTATION ON SUSTAINABLE HEALTH CARE OF PEOPLE" held at Community Development Foundation, Community Centre, Coimbatore. It also contains the suggestions and recommendations of participants present and the views of the resource faculties.

We are grateful to all the sponsoring organisations and individuals, who have provided their ideas, contributions and support to organise this consultation. Our thanks are also due to the resource faculties and participants who have contributed their views, ideas and experiences for the successful completion of the beginning of the above effort.

It was unanimously decided by the participants present in consultation to follow up the consultation with practical and useful activities and given the man date to the organising committee to continue to function. It was decided to follow up the consultation with a meeting at RDO-Coonoor, inviting more NGO's and experienced individuals to join.

We wish to acknowledge, appreciate and whole heartedly thank all those who have directly and indirectly helped in organising this first meaningful endeavour.

In Solidarity

Dated : 09.08.1995

Place : Madras-94

CONTACT ADDRESSES :

P.SAMINATHAN 1/103, Bazaar Street, Paradarami - 632 603 N.A.A. District, Phone : 04171/47269

A.S.SANKARANARAYANAN, 2/232, Somayanoor, Thadagam, Coimbatore - 641 108.

Phone : 0422/858349

G.NAMMALVAR, 7, Ezhil Nagar, Keeranur, Pudukkottai Pin 622 502 Phone : 04339/6377 M.MOHAMED USMAN On Behalf of NAM - Tamil Nadu "Haseena's Nest' 4, Sowrashtra Nagar, Fourth Street, Choolaimedu, Madras 600 094.

Phone : 044/4836953

INTRODUCTION

Basic health care of people is an essential determinant factor for the effective development of any society. In the Indian context, the poor, common folk are deliberately kept away from the nature of health care and services they really need and afford. A few decide what they assume to be good or what is needed for the common folk.

It is becoming very clear that health care has to become a people's movement, so that there can be participation and involvement of the people, the NGOs, the Government and the practioners of the different Indigenous System of Medicines at all levels. The different Indigenous systems such as Siddha, Ayurvedic, Naturopathy, Yoga, Accupressure, Unani, Homeopathy and Local Health traditions (Tribal Medicines) need to be put in proper perspective. All these systems should come together under a common forum and arrive at a common understanding of how they will collectively or complementarily be able to become involved in the promotion of sustainable Health Care of People.

The overall purpose of this two day consultative meeting was to make an attempt to bring about a clearer understanding among the NGOs involved, Govt., various professionals, health and medical practioners of the various indigenous systems and the supporting partners involved with the promotion of sustainable health care of the people.

CONSULTATIVE MEETING

The two days state level consultation on sustainable health care of people was held on the 29 & 30th June '95 at the C.D. Foundation, Community Development Centre. Chettipalayam, Coimbatore. This consultation was a Joint Action Programme of Net working for Alternative Medicine System (NAM - Tamil Nadu). It was attended by Development workers of NGOs, practioners of indigenous medicine professionals and activists from various districts in Tamil Nadu. The medium of language used at the consultation was Tamil, although there were a few presentations and views expressed in English due to the limitations of the resourcde faculties.

DAY 1 DELIBERATIONS

The first day began with the welcome and Inaugural address. In his welcome address P.Saminathan, Director, POETS, welcomed the gathering. In a brief introduction he outlined the objectives and purposes of this consultation.

- a. To discuss the evolution and the historical background of the indigenous system of medicines.
- b. To review the status of Indigenous system of medicines in the context of primary health care and new economic policy.
- c. The role and responsibilities of the NGOs and social Action Groups in promoting and revitalising the Indigenous Systems of Medicine.

He further added, and hoped that from the two days interactions, dialogue, exchange of ideas and views - it would be possible to advance towards a more meaningful understanding of activating sustainable health care so that it would bring about the following:

- a. Strengthening and promoting of a net work of Traditional Health Care workers.
- Revitlisation of age old positive health care practices.
- c. Organising a group of health professionals to impart training on the use and practice of simple herbal medicine.
- d. Providing opportunities for understanding and exchange of ideas.
- e. Development of community nursery of medicinal plants and also a production unit for simple herbal formulae, that would cater to the basic health needs of the target population.

INAUGURAL ADDRESS - HIGHLIGHTS

The consultation was inaugurated by Dr.M.Aram, M.P. President, Santi Ashram, Coimbatore. In his address, Dr.M. Aram briefly traced the history of various health traditions and their contributions to modern science and technology, particularly the influence of science on every aspect of life of which health care is paramount. He stressed the need understanding of the concepts, strategies, practices of modern medicine its outcome and the need, for more empherical

3

experimentations to conceptualise and understand the local traditional health systems.

4

He continued his presentation by sharing some of his views and ideas on the Central Government Health Schemes. He concluded by expressing his opinion that vast health care needs of our rural population still remain unattainable. It is in this context that he felt NGOs have a crucial role to play individually and collectively to initiate and strengthen the sustainable health care activities through indigenous systems of medicine.

HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

In the Presidential Address Rev. Y.David, Convenor, Social Action Movement, Tamilnadu expressed the need for people to come together as a movement so as to bring about effective health care of people. He opined that the integration of both Alopathic and Traditional Systems of medicine are extremely essential to meet the health care needs of the people whereever possible. It is not a question of rejecting one system for another but understanding these medicine systems in their proper context of health for the people. It is paramount that the rule of nature is upheld and in the given context of today where nature and the environment are endangered, nature needs to be safeguarded. With these two address, the pace for the consultation was set.

TECHNICAL SESSIONS

At the technical sessions, during which four professional experts in the field of indigenous system of medicine, presented four different aspects of these systems of medicine. Two of the technical sessions were presented in the morning and the forenoon and two technical sessions in the afternoon.

The following were presented during each of the technical sessions.

1. EVOLUTION AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF INDIGENOUS SYSTEMS OF HEALTH CARE

This sessions was delt with by Dr.R.T. Rajan, Director, SOLAI, Katpadi.

HIGHLIGHTS

He has highlighted the points that

- The emphasis should be on a proper perspective and concept of what health really should be.
- In general people identify their state of health as good or bad interms of medicines. Health dosenot mean only medicines and health has to be taken in the context of the local condition, health traditions and practices with reference to the environment of the people.
- Health infact is a search for survival.

- In this context women have tremendous energy and are the sources of all creations. This aspects should not be forgotten.
- Sustainable health of people are in their own hands - there is no need to go searching for new approaches and alternatives, when we already have our own rich health traditions within the easy reach. Therefore it is our moral responsibility to revitalise our own systems of medicines and preserve our cultural heritage.

2. IMPORTANCE OF SIDDHA IN THE 20TH CENTURY

Dr.R.Kannan, Honorary Siddha Consultant to the President, Government of India has delivered a speech on this subject. He has highlighted the following points:

- Siddha has it's original among the people of Tamil Nadu. The basic foundation for Siddha is based on human beings and their environment, their habbits and lifestyles, these contitute the main elements that decide whether the person is healthy or not. The role of meditation, accupressure and water are merely tools to achieve good results in the practice of siddha.
 - If Siddha system are to be utilised in bringing about sustainable health care, there should be recognition and respect to the people involved in the system and there will also be the need for further exploration.

3. INTEGRATION OF INDIGENOUS SYSTEMS OF MEDICINES

Dr.Brahamananda Swamigal a Siddha specialist, at Coimbatore has stressed the need for integration of all the indigenous health care system. The need of the hour is a better understanding and interaction of all the indigenous health care systems among themselves before they can be developed into sustainable health care. There are various medicinal plants and they have a variety of uses in various preparations for the day today simple treatment of various ailments. The practical strategies and action plans should be worked out for the integration of these systems.

4. THE AVAILABILITY AND UTILITY STATUS OF LOCAL RESOURCES TO MEET THE PRIMARY HEALTH CARE NEEDS

Dr.G.Gangadharan, Executive Secretary, LSPSS, Coimbatore and Dr.A.S.Sankara Narayanan, NMCT, Coimbatore have jointly presented their views and ideas towards this technical session. The following were the highlights of their speech

- There are treamendous medicinal powers in water, flora, and Fauna. Knowledge of these are with the local indigenous people. They have a knowledge of all the medicinal species and their uses for common ailments.
- It is this knowledge that is a rich resource and has to be communicated and passed on to people so that they can make use of them for their health care.

- No where else in the world poison is used as medication, if given in the right proportion and through proper administration it is very effective i.e Mercury is used in combination with other ingridients in siddha treatment in the cure of certain oilements.
- In the context of today, <u>the importance is on</u> <u>thinking globally and acting locally</u>. This principal it is essential for the effective to revitalisation and use local resources in traditional health practices to bring about lasting improvement in the health. Status of people.

The days sessions was very efficiently and effecitvely moderated by Prof. Ratnanatarajan, SIPA, Madras and concluded with questions from the participants on the various technical sessions and a summing up of the days proceedings.

DAY 2 DELIBERATIONS

On the second day of consultation (30.6.95), there were two technical sessions. These were followed by group discussions and a plenary session and was followed by the velidictry function. In the technical session the area covered included.

1. THE NEW ECONOMIC POLICY AND IT'S IMPLICATION ON INDIGENOUS SYSTEMS OF MEDICINE

Dr.Manjunath from Mysore has contributed his views and ideas on this topic.

Human being is an essential component of the ecological spectrum many aspects of traditional health care practices have been taken for granted and we are indifferent too. What is needed is health empowerment and the provision of the basic health amenities and preventivbe health care is most important, but today Government has reduced their expenditure on the provision of these amenities.

9

- NGOs just implementing programmes without realising, whether they are pro-people or against ant the effects these programmes might have on people. The role of the NGOs is therefore to bridge the gap between the Government and the people. NGOs also have a role to play in developing the indigneous medicine systems but are NGOs really ready and prepared to take up the challenge and start the fight and the strucggle against the exploitation.
- With the advent of the market economy, there is a price on everything and thereforewhat is needed is that community based, people's centred health care and selfreliance have to be developed.
- An NGO need to be flexible and has to suit the needs of it's target populations.
- The new economic policy is attempting a marriage of 2 technologies but at what cost and what then would be it's impact on indigenous medicine and this is a serious situation that has to be carefully studied.

People are going to be increasingly alianated from the use of their own medicinal resources. Indigenous people will have to pay higher prices for their indigenous medicines prepared by multi national companies. There is potential danger for indegenous knowledge system arising out of pattent rights.

2. ROLE OF NGOS IN PROMOTING AND REVITALISING INDIGENOUS SYSTEMS OF MEDICINES

Mr.Nammalvar, Secretary, KUDUMBAM and Mr.C.R.Bejoy have shared their views and ideas with regard to the role of NGOs. Mr.Nammalvar was of the opinion that the nature has got all medicine to cure most of the disease. Only man has to take advantage of the locally available natural resources to cure their ailements. Mr.C.R.Bejoy invited the participants to think deep in to the New Economic Policy and the involvement of multi-national companies in deciding th price of the Indian drugs.

If the focus is to be on cash crops in place of naural food crops, how can health for all by 2000 be possible further there is no connection between primary health care systems and services and primary health care planning.

- Basic fundamental needs are the fundamentals of human existence and these basic needs should be obtained without exploiting nature, unhealthily.

- Nature has been exploited in various ways and therefore the crucial responsibility now rests on the shoulders of the NGOs, to prevent the exploitation of the indigenous systems of medicine under the new economic policy.
- NGOs should also need to find a appropriate solution towards developing more sustainable health care for people.

GROUP DISCUSSIONS

The technical sessions were followed by group discussion. The participants were divided in to 5 groups. To facilitate a more specific discussion a few guidelines were presented to tthe groups. The questions included in the guideliness we are

- What need to be done to revitalise health care in the context of the New economic policy?
- 2. What is the role of NGOs?
- 3. How can they facilitiate and see that is more sustainable in the long run?
- 4. The time given for the group discussion was 45 minutes. All the groups actively participated in the discussions and in depth and the general outcome indicates that :
- They are aware and agree that people's participation at every level is essential.

- 2. In the context of the role of the NGOs they felt that it could be achieved by developing a meaningful partnership with people, other NGO's, Govt., and support groups at different levels.
- 3. The NGOs involved in the health work should get not only get clarity in thier approaches but also assess and understand the people's needs with regard to health.
- 4. While the outcome of the group discussions were general the specific health issues and intervensions relevant to the local environement need to be developed in follow up consultations and plannings.

VALEDICTORY ADDRESS

The consultation came to an end with the veledictory address delivered by Dr.Rajammal Devadas, Chancellor, Avinasilingam Deemed University, Coimbatore. She pointed out that in India today, there is a growing tendency to be indifferent and ignore traditional values and imitate the values and life style of the west. In the context of the consultation she further pointedout that the traditional system of medicine based on herbs and vegetarianism have stood the best of time. Research study conducted in the west have shown that diseases of the heart, eye and lungs are increasing due to the non-vegetarian diet.

She critically examined the use of synthatic chemicals such as lipstick, nail polish that are harmful to the skin. The traditional use of turmeric and "mehindi" has been proved to be healthy for the skin. She concluded the address by calling upon the active involvement of the NGOs together to popularise the use of low cost and healthy practices of traditional systems of medicine. This was followed by vote of thanks by Mr. M.Mohamed Usman, Director, ROAD. While thanking each and every one present he stressed the need for NAM continuing to be a democratic organisation to sustain the interest of the members of NAM to work together towards sustainable health of the people. He appealed to the particpants to continue to sustain their interest by internalising the importance of coming and working together for the cause of the poor and their sustainable health. He further added that NAM members should learn from the experiences, failures and suscesses of other networks of Tamilnadu and India in order to grow from strengths to strengths.

SUGGESTIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE CONSULTATION MEET

- The Government should make more budgetery provisions to support and recognision for the efforts of indigenous health practitioners.
- The Govt. should allocate funds for research and infrastructural facilities to promote ISM.
- Community herbal plant nurseries/ Gardens using the approach of joint community management should established and promoted.

13

- Provisions should be made for relevant training in indigenous medicine systems to the target population and personnale.
- NGOs should integrate traditional systems of medicine in their formal, non-formal education, health and development programmes.
- Use of the media to create awareness and publicity of the traditional health practices might ensure a larger audience coverage and the realisation of the importance of ISM.
- The traditional health care practices should be incorporated adequately in the primary health care progammes.
- The exchange of ideas and experiences should not be confined to the net work memebers alone but should be shared widely.
- Field studies/ research in ISM to be conducted and findings should be shared with others.
- Steps should be taken to bring together the practitioners and the professionals of different indigenous health care systems and the NGOs involved in the health programmes to interact for proper perspectives.
- Specific areas of primary health care need to be taken up for indepth analysis interms of indigenous system of medicine so that relevant materials should be made available to the health care workers.

CONCLUSION

This consultation has been a beginning made to bring together the various practioners of ISM and NGOs involved in the health care programmes. It was also a begining for NGOs themselves to start seriously reviewing the impact of the new economic policy and plan for alternatives.

In conclusion NAM - Tamilnadu was given a mandate to:

- Prepare guidelines for the functioning of NAM -TN and its development.
- Preparare a these based resource mainnual for the use of the concerned, in vernacular.
- Develop a comprehensive primary Health care kit for the village level Health workers, supported by relevant trainings and followups
- Promote community murseries for the exchange of herbal resources and preserving bio diversity.
- NAM-Tamilnadu should create common plat forms to the practioners of ISM and NGOs involved or interested in health care of people through workshops, seminars, conferences, consultations for exchanges of ideas, experiences and sharing of expertice.
- A data base to be created by collecting datas relating to local specific herbal plants, health traditions, practices and identifying traditional health experts for documentation and dissemination of information and guidance for wider use.

We are grateful to all the sponsoring organisation and individuals who have provided their ideas contributions and support to organise this consultation. Our thanks are also due to the resource faculties and participants who have contributed their views, ideas and experiences for the successful completion of the above effort. We wish to acknowledge appreciate and thank whole heartedly all those who have helped in organising this first meaningful endeavour directly and indirectly.

ANNEXURE - I

GUEST SPEAKER/RESOURCE PERSONS

- Dr. Kannan Hon. Siddha Doctor to President, Government of India
- Dr. M. Aram, M.P., President, Santhi Ashram, Coimbatore
- Dr. R.T. Rajan Director, SOLAI, Katpadi, N.A.A.Dt.
- 4. Rev. Y. David Social Action Movement, Trichy
- 5. Dr. Brahmananda Swamigal, Sidha Specialist Coimbatore
- 6. Dr. G.T. Gangadharan LSPSS, Coimbatore
- 7. Dr. T.N. Manjunath Mysore
- 8. Mr. C.R. Bejoy Coimbatore

.

- 9. Dr. Rajammal P. Devadas Chancellor, Avinasilingam Deemed University, Coimbatore
- 10. Prof. Ratna Natarajan SIPA, Madras
ANNEXURE - II MEMBERS OF THE ORGANISING COMMITTEE

- 1. Dr. Guna Secretary Education for Workers Development Valparai Road, Angalakuruchi Pollachi Tk Pin : 642 007
- 2. Mr. M. Mohamed Usman Director ROAD, "Haseena's Nest" No.4, 4th Street Sowrashtra Nagar Choolaimedu Madras 600 094
- 3. Mr. S. Balasubramanian Director Rural Development Organisation Gramiya Bhawan P.B.No.7 Aruvankadu 643 202
- 4. Dr. R. Muralidharan Secretary WEAL Organisation P.B.No.48 114, Palaniappa Nagar Pudukottai 622 002.
- 5. Mr. G. Nammalvar Secretary KUDUMBAM 7, Ezhil Nagar Keeranur Pudukkottai 622 502.
- Dr. A.S. Sankara Narayanan Native Medicare Charitable Trust 2/232, Somayanoor Thadagam (Via) Coimbatore 641 108.
- 7. Mr. P. Saminathan Director People's Organisation Education and Training Society (POETS) 1/103, Bazaar Street, Paradarami 632 603 Guidyattam Tk. N.A.A.Dt.

PROGRAMME CO-ORDINATORS

- 1. Mr. P. Saminathan
- 2. Dr. A.S. Sankara Narayanan

.,

ANNEXURE - III

STATEMENT OF ACCOUNT OF NAM - TAMIL NADU SEMINAR

.

I.	DONATIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS FROM:	Rs. P.
	TNVHA, Madras	10,000.00
	RIDO, Dharmapuri	5,000.00
	SIPA, Madras	5,000.00
	VHAI, New Delhi	5,000.00
	ROAD, Madras	5,000.00
	RDO, Coonur	2,950.00
	LRSA, Chenglpet	2,000.00
	SEED, Tirupattur	2,000.00
	VRDP, Salem	2,000.00
	CDAWS, Madras	2,000.00
	NMCT, Coimbatore	2,000.00
	POETS, Gudiyattam	2,000.00
	Dr. P. Vijayakumar, Coimbatore	1,500.00
	Dr. Manjunath, Mysore	500.00
	TEAM, Dharmapuri	200.00
	Dr. Seethalakshmi, Trichy	200.00
	Mr. Y. David	100.00
	Registration Fee	2,780.00

Total

50,230.00

EXPENSES

			Rs. P.
I.	PRECONFERENCE ARRANGEMENT		5,523.00
II.	VENUE ARRANGEMENTS		2,255.00
III.	PROGRAMME MATERIALS : Printouts, Certificate: Files, Pads, Pens, Bedges etc.	S	12,313.00
IV.	HONORORIUM AND MOMENTOS		3,716.50
۷.	CATERING ARRANGEMENTS		11,836.00
VI.	TRAVEL AND INCIDENTAL EXPENSES		4,031.00
VII.	STATIONARIES, POSTAGE, TELEPHONE		818.00
VIII.	MISCELLANEOUS		1,221.00
IX.	FOLLOW-UP MEETING		1,225.00
	TOTAL EXPENSES		42,938.50
	TOTAL INCOME	=	50,230.00
		BALANCE	7,291.50
			50,230.00

Comm I · Background along & NHO SEARD Bookley

Com H-36



WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION

FIFTY-SECOND WORLD HEALTH ASSEMBLY Agenda item 4 A52/DIV/9 18 May 1999

Health in development

Keynote address by Professor Amartya Sen, Master of Trinity College, Cambridge, Nobel Laureate in Economics, to the Fifty-second World Health Assembly

Geneva, Tuesday, 18 May 1999

I feel very honoured - and of course delighted - to have the opportunity of giving this lecture at this extraordinarily important conference. I feel triply privileged, first because the **occasion** is so significant (the World Health Assembly is a gathering of people who can influence the health and longevity of billions of people in the world), second because the **agenda** is so momentous (we have just heard the priorities that have been outlined by the Director-General for "a year of change"), and third because it is so wonderful to be here on the invitation of Dr Gro Harlem Brundtland for whom I have the greatest of admiration.

I have been asked to speak on the subject of "health in development". I must take on the question - the very difficult question - as to how health relates to development.¹ At one level the question admits of a simple answer: surely the enhancement of the health of the people must be accepted more or less universally to be a major objective of the process of development. But this elementary recognition does not, on its own, take us very far. We have to ask many other questions as well. How important is health among the objectives of development? Is health best promoted through the general process of economic growth which involves a rising real national income per capita, or is the advancement of health as a goal to be separated out from the process of economic growth seen on its own? Do all good things go together in the process of development, or are there choices to be made on the priorities to be chosen? How does our concern for equity reflect itself in the field of health and health care? I shall have to go into these issues also.

However, to motivate what is perhaps the most basic issue, let me begin with the report of a very old conversation between a husband and a wife on the subject of earning money. It is, of course, not unusual for couples to discuss the possibility of earning more money, but a conversation on this subject from around the 8th century BC is of some special interest. As reported in the Sanskrit text *Brihadaranyaka Unpanishad*, Maitreyee and her husband Yajnavalkya are discussing this very subject. But they proceed

¹ In answering this - and related - questions, I draw on my forthcoming book, *Development as Freedom*, to be published by Alfred Knopf, in September 1999. This lecture also has considerable affinity with my keynote address (entitled "Economic progress and health") to the 9th Annual Public Health Forum at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, on 22 April 1999, which too draws on my forthcoming book, *Development as Freedom*.

A52/DIV/9

rapidly to a bigger issue than the ways and means of becoming more wealthy: how far would wealth go to help them get what they want?¹ Maitreyee wonders whether it could be the case that if "the whole earth, full of wealth" were to belong just to her, she could achieve immortality through it. "No", responds Yajnavalkya, "like the life of rich people will be your life. But there is no hope of immortality by wealth". Maitreyee remarks, "What should I do with that by which I do not become immortal?".

Maitrevee's rhetorical question has been cited again and again in Indian religious philosophy to illustrate both the nature of the human predicament and the limitations of the material world. I have too much scepticism of other worldly matters to be led there by Maitreyee's worldly frustration, but there is another aspect of this exchange that is of rather immediate interest to economics and to understanding the nature of development. This concerns the relation between incomes and achievements, between commodities and capabilities, between our economic wealth and our ability to live as we would like. While there is a connection between opulence, on the one hand, and our health, longevity and other achievements, on the other, the linkage may or may not be very strong and may well be extremely contingent on other circumstances. The issue is not the ability to live forever on which Maitreyee - bless her soul - happened to concentrate, but the capability to live really long (without being cut off in one's prime) and to have a good life while alive (rather than a life of misery and unfreedom) - things that would be strongly valued and desired by nearly all of us. The gap between the two perspectives (that is, between an exclusive concentration on economic wealth, and a broader focus on the lives we can lead) is a major issue in the conceptualization of development. As Aristotle noted at the very beginning of the Nicomachean Ethics (resonating well with the conversation between Maitreyee and Yajravalkya three thousand miles away): "wealth is evidently not the good we are seeking; for it is merely useful and for the sake of something else".2

The usefulness of wealth lies in the things that it allows us to do - the substantive freedoms it helps us to achieve, including the freedom to live long and to live well. But this relation is neither exclusive (since there are significant other influences on our lives other than wealth), nor uniform (since the impact of wealth on our lives varies with other influences). It is as important to recognize the crucial role of wealth on living conditions and the quality of life, as it is to understand the qualified and contingent nature of this relationship. An adequate conception of development must go much beyond the accumulation of wealth and the growth of gross national product and other income-related variables. Without ignoring the importance of economic growth, we have to look well beyond it.

The ends and means of development require examination and scrutiny for a fuller understanding of the development process; it is simply not adequate to take as our basic objective merely the maximization of income or wealth, which is, as Aristotle noted, "merely useful and for the sake of something else". For the same reason economic growth cannot be treated as an end in itself. Development (as I have tried to argue in my forthcoming book, *Development as Freedom*) has to be primarily concerned with enhancing the lives we lead and the freedoms that we enjoy. And among the most important freedoms that we can have is the freedom from avoidable ill-health and from escapable mortality. It is as important to understand the qualified and contingent nature of the relationship between economic prosperity and good health as it is to recognize the crucial importance of this relationship (qualified and contingent though it may be).

¹ Brihadaranyaka Upanishad, II, iv, 2-3.

p. 7.

² Aristotle, The Nicomachean Ethics, Book I, section 5; in D. Ross's translation (Oxford University Press, 1980),

RELATIVE AND ABSOLUTE DEPRIVATION OF AFRICAN AMERICANS

Let me illustrate the conditional nature of the relationship with some empirical examples. It is quite remarkable that the extent of deprivation for particular groups in very rich countries can be comparable to that in the so-called "third world". For example, in the United States of America, African Americans as a group have no higher - indeed have a lower - chance of reaching advanced ages than do people born in the immensely poorer economies of China or the Indian State of Kerala (or in Sri Lanka, Jamaica or Costa Rica). Since I do not have the opportunity of showing you any overhead projection in this hall, you have to imagine the picture yourself. I presented charts on this in my article ("Economics of Life and Death") in the *Scientific American* in 1993, which show how the African Americans as a group are overtaken in terms of the proportion of survival by some of the poorest people in the world.¹

Even though the income per capita of African Americans in the United States of America is considerably lower than that of the American white population, they are, of course, very many times richer in income terms than the people of China or Kerala (even after correcting for cost-of-living differences). In this context, the comparison of survival prospects of African Americans with those of the very much poorer Chinese, or Indians in Kerala, is of particular interest. African Americans tend to do better in terms of survival at low age groups (especially in terms of infant mortality) *vis-à-vis* the Chinese or the Indians, but the picture changes over the years.

It turns out that Chinese men and those in Kerala in India decisively outlive American black men in terms of surviving to older age groups. Even African American women end up having a similar survival pattern for the higher ages as the much poorer Chinese, and decidedly lower survival rates than the even poorer Indians in Kerala. So it is not only the case that American blacks suffer from relative deprivation in terms of income per head *vis-à-vis* American whites, they also are absolutely more deprived than the low-income Indians in Kerala (for both women and men), and the Chinese (in the case of men), in terms of living to ripe, old ages. The causal influences on these contrasts (that is, between living standards judged by income per head and those judged by the ability to survive to higher ages) include social arrangements and community relations such as medical coverage, public health care, elementary education, law and order, prevalence of violence, and so on.²

The contrast on which I have just commented takes the African American population as a whole, and this is a very large group. If instead we consider African Americans in particularly deprived sections of the community, we get a much sharper contrast. The recent work of Christopher Murray and his colleagues shows how very different the survival rates are for the American population in different counties.³ If, for example, we take the African American male population in, say, the District of Columbia, St. Louis City, New York, or San Francisco, we find that they fall behind the Chinese or the Keralan at a remarkably early age. And this despite the fact that in terms of income per head, which is the focus of attention for standard studies of growth and development, the African Americans are much richer than the poor population with whom they are being compared in terms of survival patterns.

¹ These and other such comparisons are presented in my "The Economics of Life and Death", *Scientific American*, 266 (1993), and "Demography and Welfare Economics", *Empirica*, 22 (1995).

² On this see my "Economics of Life and Death", *Scientific American*, April 1993, and also the medical literature cited there.

³ C.J.L. Murray, C.M. Michaud, M.T. McKenna and J.S. Marks, U.S. Pattern of Mortality by County and Race: 1965-1994 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Center for Population and Development Studies, 1998).

These are striking examples, but it would be right also to note that, in general, longevity tends to go up with income per head. Indeed, this is the case even within particular counties studied by Chris Murray and others. Is there something of a contradiction here?

There is really none. Given other factors, higher income does make an individual or a community more able to avoid premature mortality and escapable morbidity. But other factors are not, in general, the same. So income is a positive influence, and yet - because of the variation of other factors (including medical facilities, public health care, educational arrangements, etc.) - there are a great many cases in which much richer people live much shorter lives and are overtaken by poorer people in terms of survival proportions. It would be just as silly to claim that higher income is **not** a contributory factor to better health and longer survival as it would be to assert that it is the **only** contributory factor. Also, on the other side, better health and survival do contribute, to some extent, to the ability to earn a higher income (given other things), but then again, other things are not given.

GROWTH-MEDIATED HEALTH DEVELOPMENT

Perhaps the relationship between health and survival, on the one hand, and per capita income levels, on the other, is worth discussing a bit more, since the literature on this is sometimes full of rather misleading conclusions. The point is often made that while the rankings of longevity and per-capita income are not congruent, nevertheless if we take the rough with the smooth, then there is plenty of evidence in intercountry comparisons to indicate that **by and large** income and life expectancy move together. From that generalization, some commentators have been tempted to take the quick step of arguing that economic progress is the real key to enhancing health and longevity. Indeed, it has been argued that it is a mistake to worry about the discord between income-achievements and survival chances, since - in general - the statistical connection between them is observed to be quite close.

Is this statistical point correct, and does it sustain the general inference that is being drawn? The point about intercountry statistical connections, seen in isolation, is indeed correct, but we need further scrutiny of this statistical relation before it can be seen as a convincing ground for taking income to be the basic determinant of health and longevity and for dismissing the relevance of social arrangements (going beyond income-based opulence).

It is interesting, in this context, to refer to some statistical analyses that have recently been presented by Sudhir Anand and Martin Ravallion.¹ On the basis of intercountry comparisons, they find that life expectancy does indeed have a significantly positive correlation with GNP per head, but that this relationship works mainly through the impact of GNP on (1) the incomes specifically of the poor, and (2) public expenditure particularly in health care. In fact, once these two variables are included on their own in the statistical exercise, little **extra** explanation can be obtained from including GNP per head as an additional causal influence. Indeed, with poverty and public expenditure on health as explanatory variables on their own, the statistical connection between GNP per head and life expectancy appears to vanish altogether.

It is important to emphasize that this does not show that life expectancy is not enhanced by the growth of GNP per head, but it does indicate that the connection tends to work particularly **through** public expenditure on health care, and **through** the success of poverty removal. Much depends on how the fruits

¹ Sudhir Anand and Martin Ravallion. "Human Development in Poor Countries: On the Role of Private Incomes and Public Services", *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 7 (1993).

of economic growth are used. This also helps to explain why some economies such as South Korea and Taiwan have been able to raise life expectancy so rapidly through economic growth, while others with similar record in economic growth have not achieved correspondingly in the field of longevity expansion.

The achievements of the East Asian economies have come under critical scrutiny - and some fire in recent years, because of the nature and severity of what is called the "Asian economic crisis". That crisis is indeed serious, and also it does point to particular failures of economies that were earlier seen mistakenly - as being comprehensively successful. Nevertheless, it would be a serious error to be dismissive about the great achievements of the East and South-East Asian economies over several decades, which have radically transformed the lives and longevities of people in these countries. I go into the positive and negative aspects of the East Asian experience more fully in my forthcoming book, *Development as Freedom*, but will not pursue them further here.

For a variety of historical reasons, including a focus on basic education and basic health care, and early completion of effective land reforms, widespread economic participation was easier to achieve in many of the East and South-East economies in a way it has not been possible in, say, Brazil or India or Pakistan, where the creation of social opportunities has been much slower and acted as a barrier for economic development.¹ The expansion of social opportunities has served as facilitator of highemployment economic development and has also created favourable circumstances for reduction of mortality rates and for expansion of life expectancy. The contrast is sharp with some other high-growth countries - such as Brazil - which have had almost comparable growth of GNP per head, but also have quite a history of severe social inequality, unemployment and neglect of public health care. The longevity achievements of these other high-growth economies have moved more slowly.

There are two interesting - and interrelated - contrasts here. The first is the disparity between different high-growth economies, in particular between those with great success in raising the length and quality of life (such as South Korea and Taiwan), and those without comparable success in these other fields (such as Brazil). The second contrast is between different economies with high achievement in raising the length and quality of life, in particular the contrast between those with great success in high economic growth (such as South Korea and Taiwan), and those without much success in achieving high economic growth (such as Sri Lanka, pre-reform China, the Indian State of Kerala).

I have already commented on the first contrast (between, say, South Korea and Brazil), but the second contrast too deserves policy attention as well. In our book, *Hunger and Public Action*, Jean Drèze and I have distinguished between two types of successes in the rapid reduction of mortality, which we called respectively "growth-mediated" and "support-led" processes.² The former process works **through** fast economic growth, and its success depends on the growth process being wide-based and economically broad (strong employment orientation has much to do with this), and also on the utilization of the enhanced economic prosperity to expand the relevant social services, including health care, education and social security. In contrast with the "growth-mediated" mechanism, the "support-led" process does not operate through fast economic growth, but works through a programme of skilful social support of health care, education, and other relevant social arrangements. This process is well exemplified by the experiences of economies such as Sri Lanka, pre-reform China, Costa Rica, or the Indian State of Kerala, which have had

¹ On this issue see my joint book with Jean Drèze, India: Economic Development and Social Opportunity (New Delhi, New York: Oxford University Press, 1995).

² Jean Drèze and Amartya Sen, Hunger and Public Action (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989); see particularly Chapter 10.

very rapid reductions in mortality rates and enhancement of living conditions, without much economic growth.

PUBLIC PROVISIONING, LOW INCOMES AND RELATIVE COSTS

The "support-led" process does not wait for dramatic increases in per-capita levels of real income, and it works through priority being given to providing social services (particularly health care and basic education) that reduce mortality and enhance the quality of life. In a comparison on which I have commented elsewhere, we may, for illustrative purposes, look at the gross national product (GNP) per head and life expectancy at birth of six countries (China, Sri Lanka, Namibia, Brazil, South Africa and Gabon) and one sizeable State (Kerala), with 30 million people, within a country (India). Despite their very low levels of income, the people of Kerala, or China, or Sri Lanka enjoy enormously higher levels of life expectancy than do the much richer populations of Brazil, South Africa and Namibia, not to mention Gabon. Even the **direction** of the inequality points oppositely when we compare Kerala, China and Sri Lanka, on one side, with Brazil, South Africa, Namibia and Gabon, on the other. Since life expectancy variations relate to a variety of social opportunities that are central to development (including epidemiological policies, health care, educational facilities, and so on), an income-centred view is in serious need of supplementation, in order to have a fuller understanding of the process of development.¹ These contrasts are of considerable policy relevance, and bring out the importance of the "support-led" process.²

People in poor countries are, of course, persistently disadvantaged by many handicaps; the picture is one of diverse adversities. And yet, when it comes to health and survival, perhaps nothing is as immediately important in many poor countries in the world today as the lack of medical services and provisions of health care. The nature and reach of pervasive deprivation of biomedical services is brought out most vividly by Paul Farmer's recent study, *Infections and Inequalities: The Modern Plagues.*³ The failures apply to perfectly treatable diseases (such as cholera, malaria, etc.) to more challenging ailments (such as AIDS and drug-resistant TB). But in each case, a major difference can be brought about by a public determination to do something about these deprivations.

THE ECONOMICS AND POLITICS OF HEALTH CARE

Surprise may well be expressed about the possibility of financing "support-led" processes in poor countries, since resources are surely needed to expand public services, including health care and education. The need for resources cannot be denied in any realistic accounting, but it is also a question of balancing the costs involved against the benefits that can be anticipated in human terms. Financial prudence is not the real enemy here. Indeed, what really should be threatened by financial conservatism is the use of public resources for purposes where the social benefits are very far from clear, such as the massive expenses that now go into the military in one poor country after another (often many times larger than the public

¹ On this see my "From Income Inequality to Income Inequality", Distinguished Guest Lecture to the Southern Economic Association, published in *Southern Economic Journal*, 64 (October 1997), and "Mortality as an Indicator of Economic Success and Failure", first Innocenti Lecture to the UNICEF (Florence: UNICEF, 1995), also published in *Economic Journal*, 108 (January 1998).

² See also Richard A. Easterlin, "How Beneficient is the Market? A Look at the Modern History of Mortality" mimeographed, University of Southern California, 1997.

³ Paul Farmer, Infections and Inequalities: The Modern Plagues (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1998).

7

expenditure on basic education or health care). It is an indication of the topsy-turvy world in which we live that the doctor, the schoolteacher or the nurse feels more threatened by financial conservatism than does the General and the Air Marshall. The rectification of this anomaly calls not for the chastising of financial prudence, but for a fuller accounting of the costs and benefits of the rival claims.

This important issue also relates to two central aspects of social living, in particular the recognition of the role of participatory politics, and the need to examine economic arguments with open-minded scrutiny. If the allocation of resources is systematically biased in the direction of arms and armaments, rather than in the direction of health and education, the remedy of that has to lie ultimately in informed public debate on these issues, and ultimately on the role of the public in seeking a better deal for the basic requirements of good living, rather than efficient killing. Nothing perhaps is as important for resource allocation in health care as the development of informed public discussion, and the availability of democratic means, for incorporating the lessons of a fuller understanding of the choices that people in every country face.

The second issue is that of economic scrutiny. It is, in particular, important to see the false economics involved in an argument that is often presented against early concentration on health care. Lack of resources is frequently articulated as an argument for postponing socially important investments until a country is already richer. Where (as the famous rhetorical question goes) are the poor countries going to find the means for "supporting" these services? This is indeed a good question, but it also has a good answer, which lies very considerably in the economics of relative costs. The viability of this "support-led" process is dependent on the fact that the relevant social services (such as health care and basic education) are very labour intensive, and thus are relatively inexpensive in poor - and low-wage - economies. A poor economy may have less money to spend on health care and education, but it also needs less money to spend to provide the same services, which would cost much more in the richer countries. Relative prices and costs are important parameters in determining what a country can afford. Given an appropriate social commitment, the need to take note of the variability of relative costs is particularly important for social services in health and education.¹

A CONCLUDING REMARK

So what conclusions do we draw from these elementary analyses? How does health relate to development? The first point to note is that the enhancement of health is a constitutive part of development. Those who ask the question whether better health is a good "instrument" for development may be overlooking the most basic diagnostic point that good health is an integral part of good development; the case for health care does not have to be established instrumentally by trying to show that good health may also help to contribute to the increase in economic growth.

Second, given other things, good health and economic prosperity tend to support each other. Healthy people can more easily earn an income, and people with a higher income can more easily seek medical care, have better nutrition, and have the freedom to lead healthier lives.

Third, "other things" are not given, and the enhancement of good health can be helped by a variety of actions, including public policies (such as the provision of epidemiological services and medical care). While there seems to be a good general connection between economic progress and health achievement, the connection is weakened by several policy factors. Much depends on how the extra income generated

¹ This issue is discussed in Drèze and Sen, Hunger and Public Action (1989).

A52/DIV/9

8

by economic growth is used, in particular whether it is used to expand public services adequately and to reduce the burden of poverty. Growth-mediated enhancement of health achievement goes well beyond mere expansion of the rate of economic growth.

Fourth, even when an economy is poor, major health improvements can be achieved through using the available resources in a socially productive way. It is extremely important, in this context, to pay attention to the economic considerations involving the relative costs of medical treatment and the delivery of health care. Since health care is a very labour-intensive process, low-wage economies have a relative advantage in putting **more** - not **less** - focus on health care.

Finally, the issue of social allocation of economic resources cannot be separated from the role of participatory politics and the reach of informed public discussion. Financial conservatism should be the nightmare of the militarist, not of the doctor, or the schoolteacher, or the hospital nurse. If it is the doctor or the schoolteacher or the nurse who feels more threatened by resource considerations than the military leaders, then the blame must at least partly lie on us, the public, for letting the militarist get away with these odd priorities.

Ultimately, there is nothing as important as informed public discussion and the participation of the people in pressing for changes that can protect our lives and liberties. The public has to see itself not merely as a patient, but also as an agent of change. The penalty of inaction and apathy can be illness and death.

Cont 14 36+8

COMH 36.

ber, deepite

ORGANIZING PEOPLE FOR HEALTH -Problems and Contradictions.

Dr. Anant R.S.

In this brief note, I would like to share a few arguments and opinions on this unresolved issue. They are based on the experience of work in a health-educationconscientization project in a few rather remote, backward villages near Pune; and on the debates, discussions in the Medico-Friend-Circle. Elaboration can be done during the course of discussion in the Seminar.

General Perspective on Health-work

Most of the major determinants of the health status of a population-food, water, sanitation, shelter, workenvironment, cultural relations..... are far beyond the control of health workers. But Medicos can, with the help of the community, organize preventive and therapeutic (symptomatic or curative) services, can do health-education and advise the planners on health-implications of different socio-economic interventions. These medical interventions are very valuable to prevent certain deaths and diseases, to relieve human suffering. But they have only a marginal role in improving the overall health-status of the population. For example, infant and child mortality can be reduced with immunizations and ORT ... etc. but no health-programme has abolished malnourishment in children of a nation.

The department of health aiming to improve the health of the people through so many national disease control programmes. and now through the programme of 'Health for all by 2000 A.D.' is therefore a utopian, misleading idea. As a part of a thoroughgoing socio-economic change, medical interventions can be a very good supplementary tool to improve the overall But provision of adquate, effective accessible

dealth are service to all it & Palit decision + also political actually -chalonic, the is not being done in Suche

health-status of the people. But the idea that "Health for all by 2000 A.D." would be delivered by the health-ministry/ health projects by the NGOs, though very attractive, is a misleading one. All that health-people can hope to achieve is "Health-care for all by 2000 A.D."

This is not sterile semantics. There is a strong reason and a context for making this distinction. There is a wide-spread technocratic, and managerial illusion that improvement in Health of a nation, which is in reality, primarily a function of socio-economic development, can be achieved with technological, managerial interventions. Lay people are made to believe that the beneficient State through its Health-Programmes, or the Health-Projects run by the NGOs, would improve the health of the people with the help of modern science and technology. These slogans are being promoted in the context of the continuing crisis in the economy leading to increase in poverty, unemployment, inflation, drought and ecological disaster. Other basic element required by for the success of " Health for All " - improvement in socioeconomic situation of the people--is in practice, missing due to this economic crisis. What remains is the misleading idea of " Health for all " to be achieved by the efforts of the health-workers.

Those who undertake health-work primarily with an intention of not 'giving a few pills' but of doing some 'basic-work' can, in fact, make very valuable, basic work. Many improvements and some thoroughgoing changes are needed, many new ideas, practices have to be founded and developed, many vested interests to be fought in the field of organizing medical care and health-education. This is not a purely technocratic work. There are many sociological, ideological, technical, practical issues to be resolved. Health-work, done with the aim of taking up one of the many challenging issues, can be very valuable, basic work, a historical need today.

.2.

But in the existing socio-economic frame-work and its crisis, let there be no illusion of really improving the overall health of the people through health-work. Depende on what once definition framework of

Health-work alone ?

fealth up R'is.

Anybody, who has any idea of the situation at the grassrcot level, would agree, that in the rural-areas, it is not possible to build an organization of the common people around health-issues. The problem of poverty and of paucity of basic amenities is so overwhelming that rural poor are not in a position to rally round exclusively for health. Those, whose basic needs are met, can perhaps form an organization on issues like occupational health. Recently, in Pune, a Citizens' group has been formed to discuss and work even on the issue of mental health. In rural areas, and in the unorganized sections in the cities, however, things are quite different. But at the same time, unless poor people become aware of health-issues and actively seek, influence medical services, these services would continue to be cut off from the people, and would continue to serve the interests primarily of those who make them available, rather than the interests of those who need these services. In other words, " health-care for all " can not be realized in its true spirit unless it is "Health by All"--unless the people themselves actively participate in the decision making and implementation. Even if it is not possible to build an organization of rural poor exclusively on health, health should be one of the activities of group trying to organize the rural poor for justice and for development.

It is with this perspective, that a health-education-cum conscientization work is being done for last seven years in a rather remote, backward area near Pune. Neither the Village Community Development Association, on whose behest this work

is being done nor the local organizations are health-organizations as such. Health-work is considered a part of a broader work of education, conscientization, organization on a range of socio-economic issues. Health is considered neither the main issue nor a mere entry point. Even with a limited aim, and with the support of the broader social work done by the local organization, the process of increasing the health-awareness amongst this marginalized population and of fostering collective self-help has been very gradual one and beset with many problems.

Achievements, problems, contradictions

Cur health-work consists of training of Village Health Workers (chosen by the marginalized people themselves) in the diagnosis and treatment of routine viral fevers, malaria, diarrhoea, conjunctivitis, scabies, wounds, skin infections ... etc.; and distribution of iron and vitamin-A supplements to children and pregnant women. These elementary curative services are used to : (i) establish the credibility of the Village Health Workers; (ii) as an occasion to interact with the people, (iii) an attempt to meet the felt-need of the people. Rural poor are not much interested in general health-education; given the arduous life they live. But a rural poor is more inclined to listen to why's and how's of diarrhoea-control, when he/she is suffering from diarrhoea and effective treatment is given by the same person who gives health-education about diarrhoea. Hence the strategy of coupling health-education and therapeutics.

The result of this strategy is a mixed one. Let me give some examples of positive experiences and then of some problems and difficulties :

.4.

Our V.H.W.s have a much greater support from the community than what the Government's VHW has. They are trained much better because both the trainee and the trainer are really interested in this work and its philosophy. These VHWs spend a lot of time for this work; attend frequent meetings, participate in other programmes of the organization, travel to and camp at other villages. All this is possible because of a support from the community. The honorarium of a mere Rs.50/- p.m. does not explain the interest, efforts of these VHWs. (Many of the VHWs . even do not get any monthly honorarium). The quack practice of some traditional therapists and that of the compounder-turned-doctor, has been considerably curtailed. Some dent has been male in the ' injection-culture.' People have collectively appro--ached the health-authorities to complain about some specific grievences about delivery of health services. (for example, a Morcha about a case of injection-palsy; representations about below par functioning of health-services at the grassroot level...etc.) Slide-shows organized by VHWs on prevalent diseases like scabies, diarrhoea are quickly being sought after. More than one hundred women from different villages had walked for a few kilometres and had waited patiently for hours to see a slide-show on women's reproductive health. This indicates the interest of rural women in knowing about their own body and health. Discussions in meetings and Shibirs about nutritional requirements of labourers, and of women; about the relation between water-supply and health has had an impact. In the consciousness of a section of the people in the organization, this new health-knowledge has given. an additional justification for the demand of higher minimum wages, of leave from hard work during pregnancy, for improvement in water-supply.

These developments are in a way collective attempts towards control over health-care activities; are rudimentary forms of organized efforts around health-issues. However, alongwith such achievements, there are some knotty problems

.5.

which show that it is still a long way to go before the awareness of the health-problems increases to such an extent that people start influencing the health-services and policies in accordance with their own needs.

i) There is a tremendous gap between the consciousness of health-workers and that of the people. People are primarily interested in medicines; rather than knowledge. There is a strong tendency of going to the commercial quack for an injection, pay him five or ten rupees. But when it comes to paying ten paise for the tablet taken from the VHW, there is a tendency of not paying for this self-help, even though over a period of time, people have realized that these tablets are as effective as these injections. There is less of a tendency to see that this process of self-help becomes self-reliant; the dominant tendency is either to seek free treatment from a beneficient authority or to seek a commercial treatment. It is not easy to go beyond the stereotype responses conditioned by the dominant-culture.

ii) Many people as yet see the work done by VHWs, not done bt the as a kind of social work/ representatives of the people. Many feel that these VHWs work 'because they do not need to work at home' or 'because they must be getting something from the agency.' This is in spite of the fact that these VHWs were chosen by the people in a meeting; their help and advice is sought; a call for a meeting, Shibir or even for a Morcha is positively responded to. But still the idea of a movement has not taken real roots.

iii) The Government health structure his cooperated by providing medicines, sending their health-personnel at request etc. In one remote area, a few of our illiterate VHWs were incorporated as Government's " Village Health Guides " (because the PHC doctor was very much impressed by their knowledge), even though the minimum educational qualification required for this post is 8th standard. (This mutual cooperation helps the health-authorities to fulfil their targets for remote areas.) But the Government-authorities (all male) dislike the questioning attitude, " rude manners " of our women-VHWs. When our VHWs asked a PHC-doctor, in a meeting; about the budget of the PHC, and the expenditures under different heads, he got infuriated. Relations were also strained because a Morcha was organized to demand justice in case of an injection-palsy in a boy after an injection in his arm. Any attempt to take . democracy seriously, to know and to question some of the practices in the PHC are frowned upon. The 'beneficient authority' obliges by cooperating as long as its hegemony is not threatened. " People's participation " is a nice slogan, but when it is taken seriously in a critical fashion, such attempts are despised. This in turn dampens the already low initiative of the prople for asserting their own rights.

Such are the problems and contradictions in the process of 'organizing people for health-care.' Both from a theoretical as well as practical view point, there is no doubt, that without the collective participation, control by the people in fulfilling their health-care needs, the health-delivery system will not really serve the people. But the process is a very complex, slow and difficult one. It is easier to talk about nice things, but very difficult to achieve them. A lot of practical and analytical work has to be done before we can confidently talk about a strategy of "health-care by the people" or under the control of the people.

000

000

.7.

Magic cley.

COMH-36.

WORLD FAITHS DEVELOPMENT DIALOGUE

E-mail wfdd@btinternet.com Web site http://www.wfdd.org.uk

BULLETIN NO. 15 July 2004

The Future of WFDD

NP2

At their meeting in June the Trustees of WFDD decided to move the WFDD office to Washington USA after my retirement as Director on 31" July. Meanwhile WFDD's e-mail address remains the same as does its web site. You will be informed about a new postal address, telephone and fax numbers as soon as these have been arranged.

MU 01111 personal e-mail ic. <u>m.h.taylor@bham.ac.uk</u> if any of you wish to keep in touch.

The last two and a half years have not been without their difficulties but they have also been full of interest, opportunity, enriching experiences and many new friendships. I remain convinced of the importance and truitfulness of focusing interfaith dialogue and co-operation round key human issues like poverty reduction and development. I am grateful to so many of you for your interest in the work we have tried to do and for your practical support.

Maggie Clay, my assistant, will also be leaving WFDD on 31st July. She has made an immense contribution in all sorts of ways, from keeping our accounts to fieldwork in Africa to organising international seminars and workshops. 1 and WFDD owe her a big debt of gratitude.

We both send our good wishes to you all.

Michael Taylor

J~2 3 8 04

The following paragraphs are extracts from the Director's final report to the Trustees in June.

New Delhi Workshop

The workshop was held, as planned, on 9-10 February under the joint auspices of the Vikram Sarabhai Foundation and WFDD. Eleven case studies from 4 faith traditions (Buddhist, Christian, Hindu and Muslim) were presented and discussed. In addition to the case study writers, representatives of the UK government's Department for International Development and of the World Bank were invited. Tweniv-fou people participated including two Trustees and 3 members of staff. Etienne Zikra from Cameroon was prevented from attending at the last minute due to security procedures

The workshop turned out to be an interesting extremely occasion characterised by a high level of listening and learning and a common vision of a holistic approach to development taking full account of its spiritual dimensions. Wendy Tyndale wrote up two reports, one of them thematic. which have been circulated to participants and trustees and posted on WFDD's website. Wendy Tyndale is also pursuing the possibility of incorporating the insights gained into a book of her own.

Project: Faith in the Global Economic System.

Vineeta Shanker is now well into her second year of work on this project, fully funded by the Allan and Nesta Ferguson Trust. Towards the end of the first year she presented a well-received paper to a seminar jointly sponsored by the Centre for the Study of Global Ethics in the University of Birmingham UK and WFDD. It set out some of her findings, after a series of visits and interviews in Africa and Asia, about how different faith To Dr CMF, RN for who -> traditions relate lib = resource file on Interfaith Dealogue, Development + Health traditions relate both positively and negatively to the economy.

Arrest

Her visit to the UK also provided staff (with the help of colleagues in the Global Ethics Centre) with an opportunity to review the project and plan the second year's work. It was agreed to narrow its scope to two faith traditions: Islam and Buddhism, and to limit the number of countries to be visited in order to make realistic use of limited resources and deepen reflection on the issues.

Development Gateway

WFDD received a grant of SUS30,500 from the Development Gateway to build on the fieldwork carried out last year in Ghana, Uganda, Tanzania and Malawi. The fieldworker spent five weeks in Tanzania gathering information about the activities of faith communities in poverty reduction and development in the hope of providing AiDA (Accessible Information on Development Activities) with a complete set of information to be added to its database.

The Development Gateway is a website

(www.developmentgateway.org)

incorporating vast amounts of information on development programmes and issues and AiDA is one part of it.

The WFDD exercise, seen as a contribution to efforts to 'scale-up' the programmes of faith communities, has thrown up a number of questions (eg about the size of programmes, the distinction between faith communities and faith-based NGOs, the benefits of the database to faith communities) which were raised with AiDA's Steering Group, of which the Director is a member, in Bonn on 29 June.

Seminar for African Faith Leaders

It became clear from the workshops in Ghana and Tanzania (2003) that many, though not all, faith leaders found it difficult to engage in discussions greatly affecting their neonle, on issues relating to poverty reduction strategies, because of their unfamiliarity with the workings of the macro-economic order. As a result the Director asked the Rockefeller Foundation if it would agree, as it did, to WFDD using the remainder of its grant for the workshops to fund a seminar for African faith leaders aimed at increasing knowledge and understanding (rather than polemics) of the global economy and its implications for poverty reduction and human development.

The seminar had been arranged (with a great deal of help from the All Africa Council of Churches) for September 2004 in Nairobi for about 50 leaders. Due to changes in WFDD's personnel, however, and the decision to move to Washington, the seminar has been postponed until a later date.

Parliament of the World's Religions

The Director was invited to a preparatory meeting, arranged by the Council for a Parliament of the World's Religions, in Kericho in Kenya in March, to explore among other things the issue of international debt. He also accepted an invitation to a pre-Parliament Assembly in Montserrat 4-7 July and to the Parliament meeting in Barcelona 7-13 July where WFDD arranged a dialogue session between an international, interfaith group of young people (with their expenses paid by SHUMEI: a Japanese Shinto spiritual organisation) and faith leaders such as Sulak Siyaraksa on Visions of Development.

Several of the young people came from the communities represented at the New Delhi workshop They sat in a circle with Sulak and surrounded by several other circles of interested listeners who later joined in the conversation Sulak listened carefully and then responded to what they had to say about their commitments and hopes for the future. He said they had made him feel young again.

The Director had a major commitment to the workshops on international debt at both Montserrat and Barcelona. Monserrat, just over an hour's drive from Barcelona, is an active Benedictine monastery perched on a high rocky crag and was itself an inspiration. At the Parliament he also shared in a panel discussion with Katherine Marshall of the World Bank and Sulak Sivaraksa which attracted about 200 people. The panel attempted to draw them into the work of WFDD as it encourages dialogue and cooperation on poverty reduction and human development between faith communities at the international, national and local levels and between those communities and international institutions like the World Bank The official theme of the session was 'Faith or Economics' but we preferred to call it 'Faith and Economics' and explored the relationships between the

Various

a) WFDD's contribution to the World <u>Development Report 2004</u> was eventually published, along with others, on a CD-rom with apologies that they had not been acknowledged in the Report itself.

b) The <u>Seminar Series</u> on 'Alternatives' to global capitalism, run jointly with the Centre for the Study of Global Ethics in the University of Birmingham UK, to which Vineeta Shanker made a contribution, was completed on 7 June.

c) The <u>website</u> has been kept up-to-date by Wendy Tyndale with the help of Sarah Boys.

d) Wendy Tyndale worked the equivalent of one day a week, mainly in the early months of the year and on the New Delhi workshop. With the Director she attended a meeting in January at the UK Treasury in London hosted by Lord Carey and addressed by Gordon Brown and Jim Wolfensohn among others. In June she represented WFDD at the inaugural meeting of the Parliament of Cultures in Ankara. Turkey.

Just published

Mind Heart and Soul in the Fight against Poverty

Edited by Katherine Marshall and Lucy Keogh World Bank 2004

Stories from around the world of faith communities working together and with new partners to fight poverty and improve the lives of poor communities.